

1 SAHTU RENEWABLE RESOURCE BOARD

2 PUBLIC HEARING

3

4 BLUENOSE-WEST MANAGEMENT HEARING

5

6

7

8 Panel Members:

9 Facilitator Walter Bayha

10 Member Robert Kelly

11 Member Camilla Rabasca

12 Member Paul Latour

13 Member Keith Hickling

14 Member Rosa Etchinelle

15

16

17

18

19 HELD IN:

20 Fort Good Hope, NWT

21 November 21st, 2007

22 Day 1 of 3

23

24

25

1 APPEARANCES
2 John Donihee) Board Counsel
3
4 Susan Fleck) ENR
5 Alasdair Veitch)
6 Marsha Branigan)
7 Boyan Tracz)
8 Jan Adamczewski)
9
10 Chief Richard Kochon) Behdzi Ahda' First
11 Joseph Kochon) Nation
12
13 Wilbert Kochon) Ayoni Keh Land
14 Alvin Orlias) Corporation
15
16 David Codzi) Behdzi Ahda'
17) Renewable
18) Resource Council
19
20 Harry Harris) Fort Good Hope
21 Tammy Proctor) Renewable Resource
22 Roger Boniface) Council
23
24
25

TABLE OF CONTENTS	Page No.	
1		
2		
3	List Of Undertakings	5
4	Opening Comments	6
5		
6	Presentation by ENR	17
7	Question Period	42
8		
9	Public Presentations	74
10		
11	Continued Question Period for ENR	87
12		
13		
14	Reporter's Certificate	168
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

	LIST OF UNDERTAKINGS		
2	No.	Description	Page No.
3	1	For ENR to use the caribou calculator model from the Porcupine Harvest Strategy Workshop and input information in there to look at the different harvest rates that are being discussed for the Bluenose-West herd and do that within a month	139
10	2	For ENR to provide a listing chronologically of community engagement meetings between ENR and other agencies in respect of the Bluenose-West caribou herd from 2005 to the present, including meetings that have been held with Gwich'in and Inuvialuit as well and to provide it no later than a month	143
19	3	ENR to provide a more contemporary analysis or what consideration was given to coming up with 3 percent. To complete within a month.	147
23			
24			
25			

1 --- Upon commencing at 10:07 a.m.

2

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Can we get everybody to
4 sit down? We're going to start with an opening prayer.
5 Richard is going to lead us today with an opening prayer.
6 Mahsi, Richard.

7

8 (OPENING PRAYER)

9

10 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Richard. You
11 know, as -- before I -- I start with the, you know, this
12 -- this meeting, I guess I'll have to call it to order.
13 The -- I have, you know, starting with the -- the opening
14 remarks today, you know, first of all, you know, good
15 morning to everybody.

16 It's -- it's taken a little while to get
17 rolling here this morning. The -- before I get into --
18 to -- to the stuff that I'm going to -- to get into the
19 record here for our hearing, the -- you know, I talked to
20 a lot of the people here in Colville Lake, and some of
21 them are sometimes gets a little confusing of how these -
22 - these hearings work.

23 So let me know if -- if you've got an
24 issue with the agenda or if you want some information
25 that you've handed to us. We have the information

1 here. We'll -- we'll help wherever we can and Jody's
2 going to be around and I'm going to be around so.

3 My name is Walter Bayha and I think I met
4 most of you. And I chair the Sahtu Renewable Resources
5 Board. You know, it's good -- it's good to be back here
6 in Good Hope and, you know, a lot of times sometimes we
7 have this, you know, hearings like this where -- where,
8 you know, we -- you know, we're charged with managing
9 wildlife and, you know, even to this day we still, you
10 know, after all these years with the -- with the claims,
11 many things are still confusing.

12 But I think to the -- to the Dene people,
13 you know, certain resources in our country have been a
14 part of our lives and part of the lives of our
15 grandfathers, their grandfathers and, certainly, many of
16 the people here in -- in the Sahtu today.

17 You know, today is -- is a milestone, and
18 it's a day to remember because this is the first time
19 that we're going to, you know, have a hearing about --
20 about a very special resource in your country where
21 you're going to be part of the decision-making process.

22 You're going to decide on a part of your
23 information here or your -- would be put into, you know a
24 decision to manage the Bluenose-west Caribou Herds,
25 certainly in a way that -- that is there for all the

1 people in the future.

2 You know the Dene of Colville Lake have
3 been a primary user of this herd in Sahtu, and history
4 tells us they want to continue that. They want to
5 continue that tradition. You know, traditional use of
6 this resource is prime importance to everybody.

7 We can go through the history and review
8 the way the Dene people have lived with caribou, you
9 know, but that would take a long time, you know. Here
10 our focus should be and purpose should be whether to --
11 to put a cap on those numbers we harvest in the Bluenose-
12 West or not.

13 So I think, you know, I'd like to focus on
14 that and I'd like to give you some examples. You know,
15 you know, let us focus on questions like, Are we taking
16 too many caribou today?

17 We also must remember that there's other
18 users of the Bluenose-West Caribou in the NWT; the
19 Inuvialuit, the Gwich'in to a limited extent.

20 You know, our Board must make a decision
21 that is fair to everyone and yet maintain a strong
22 support for the herd to sustain itself.

23 A Sahtu -- our Board is established by the
24 -- the Sahtu claims, you know, back in 1993. And today
25 this Board, you know, one (1) of the words had come out

1 is the main instrument of wildlife forest management
2 within the Sahtu settlement area. That's very important.

3 I think today, you know, when -- when you
4 hear that this Board is going to -- is -- is having a
5 hearing to -- to -- to make some decision on -- on the --
6 on some of the numbers that we're taking -- caribou that
7 we're taking from the Bluenose-west Herd, I think you
8 realize how important our Board is.

9 You know, the Board and everyone knows the
10 Board is made up of -- 50 percent of our members are
11 nominated from the Sahtu Secretariat Incorporated, 50
12 percent are -- are nominated by the Government of Canada
13 and the NWT.

14 And all the appointments are made jointly
15 between the Government and Council and the Government of
16 Northwest Territories Executive Council. The -- the
17 Board also operates as an Institute of Public Government.
18 And I guess it's responsible for acting in the public
19 interest.

20 The, you know, the Board's, you know,
21 they're all sitting here and I'm -- I'm sure most of you
22 met -- met them before but I'd just like to point them
23 out.

24 We have to our right, furthest right, here
25 is Robert Kelly, Camilla Rabasca, myself here and then

1 Keith -- or -- or Keith and then Rosa and Paul.

2 And, you know, we'll have a lot breaks and
3 stuff like that and, you know, you can probably meet them
4 if you haven't met them. But that's probably the extent
5 that we -- we want to associate with the public.

6 We also have -- we also have our staff
7 with us and our legal counsel. I think -- I think we
8 have names there you could see. John Donihee is our
9 legal counsel. We have -- I think everybody has met Lori
10 Ann Lennie, she's staff with our Board.

11 Glen Guthrie, he's also staff and you've
12 seen Jody running around here somewhere. There she is.
13 She's our Executive Director.

14 Okay, this -- this whole Hearing started
15 with the fact that our Board was -- was requested by the
16 Department Environment and Natural Resources. You know,
17 there's certain things that they wanted the Board to do
18 and part of was to -- to look at the -- some of the
19 recommendations they made.

20 And particularly the recommendations on
21 their -- to cap the number of caribou that they're taking
22 from the Bluenose-West. So basically ENR's request that
23 the -- our Board establish management actions to reduce
24 harvesting on the Bluenose-West Caribou Herd including
25 establishing a total allowable harvest.

1 Okay, any Sahtu claims, you know, this is
2 a quote from there:

3 "A public hearing shall be held when
4 the Board tends to consider
5 establishing a total allowable harvest
6 and Sahtu needs level in respect of a
7 species or population of wildlife which
8 has not been subject to a total
9 allowable harvest level within the
10 previous two (2) years."

11 So basically what that says is that when
12 we started looking at capping, when we started looking at
13 numbers, you know, when we say, well maybe we should
14 limit numbers of caribou that people take, then yes, our
15 claims requires that we hold a public hearing.

16 So this is what we're doing. So based on
17 a land claims agreement they -- our Board must hold a
18 public hearing to permit all interested parties an
19 opportunity to express their views on barren-ground
20 caribou management Sahtu settlement area, that is, before
21 our Board decides whether it will establish a total
22 allowable harvest.

23 Okay, some of the other information like
24 public notice of the hearing was advertised in News/North
25 on October 15, October 5th, 12th and 19th and was

1 distributed to all the communities and the Sahtu on
2 October 15, November 12. Beginning November 13 the
3 public notice was advertised daily on CBC and CKLB radio,
4 as well as the public registry was established on October
5 30th and updated regularly.

6 There are nineteen (19) registered parties
7 in attendance; six (6) community organization, twelve
8 (12) individuals and ENR. Four (4) parties -- four (4)
9 parties have provided a written submission and that was
10 put on the SRB public registry.

11 As well, each community has a number of
12 Elders that will speak. The Board's Executive Director
13 has been working with the parties to ensure that the
14 hearing process runs smoothly and that the Board secures
15 the information that is -- that it needs to respond to
16 the ENR's request.

17 Hearing introductions were provided on
18 November 15, 2007 to all registered parties. The other
19 thing you have to be really cognisant and aware is that
20 these -- all of these proceedings are recorded and
21 transcribed by Sean Coleman, Digi-Tran Incorporated
22 reporter.

23 So I'm going to keep saying now over the -
24 - over the course of the meeting here, therefore, I want
25 everybody to speak, you know, and when you speak, you

1 know, make sure you mention your name and who you
2 represent.

3 And, you know, I'd also like to -- to
4 introduce and be mindful of, we have interpreters, Dora
5 Grandejambe. I'm sure everybody knows her and Lucy Ann,
6 they've been interpreters for a long time and excellent.
7 And they've done a good job over the years for us as well
8 so.

9 And then one of the other things that
10 whenever we have interpreters and it goes back and forth
11 with -- with ourselves too that we need to pace yourself.
12 You know, give them a lot of breaks so that they make
13 sure that they catch everything that you're -- you're
14 saying to our Board.

15 So here's the way things we have planned
16 here, the order of proceedings. The Board will first,
17 you know, of all hear from ENR their proposal before the
18 Board. They have approximately an hour to -- to make
19 their presentation.

20 Okay, once the presentation -- ENR has
21 completed their presentation, then all the registered
22 parties can -- can question them. And then the -- the --
23 the legal counsel, our staff, the general public and then
24 last of all our Boards.

25

1 Our Boards are going to be last to
2 question all of the proceedings as we go along. Once the
3 questions to ENR are complete, we'll proceed to present
4 presentations from all the other parties who have been
5 registered. All the ones that were registered and we
6 have the information here, you can look at it whenever
7 you want.

8 Each of them would probably have maybe up
9 to around fifteen (15) minutes to make their
10 presentations. And they have to be aware that is for the
11 entire presentations.

12 Okay, we have Glen here, we have got a
13 time keeper here and as soon as, you know, you go over
14 your timing, you will probably hear from him, but I will
15 leave it at that and we will see how we can manage that.

16 Okay, there is an opportunity for you --
17 all of the presentations' questions for you, all of the
18 presentations, firstly by ENR, then in the same order as
19 previously set out. So you will see, once we go through
20 the first presentation and who speaks first and those
21 kinds of things, I think you will have an idea of how
22 things work.

23 And at the end of each day, there will be,
24 you know, time set aside for the public to speak.

25

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

2

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Oh, there we go. Oh,
4 you see what they just told me, I cannot speak when the
5 mic goes off because they cannot record.

Anyway, each day, like I mentioned, time set aside for the public, you know, after lunch, so the public can speak each day after that.

9

10 (BRIEF PAUSE)

11

20 Our Board, and although it is a quasi-
21 judicial we try to keep it very informal. I do not want
22 to look like, you know, a legal Board hearing here, this
23 is not what it is, it is your Board, and we will try to
24 make it as informal as we can

25 But I always have to remind you, and

1 certainly remind myself, that because we are bound by
2 rules of procedure fairness, we have to be fair, and
3 those rules are there and we are aware of that.

4 And as a Chair, I must make sure of the
5 conduct of this hearing. So I would ask that all
6 comments and any requests be addressed through the Chair,
7 you know, it makes things a little simpler and I can keep
8 track of things a little more easier.

9 Okay, at the end of the hearing, the
10 registered party will have an opportunity to present
11 closing remarks, as the party had filed the request, ENR
12 will go last. All closing comments will be limited to no
13 more than fifteen (15) minutes, or around there. I will
14 make closing comments and then the Hearing will come to a
15 close.

16 Every day these Hearings are scheduled
17 between 9:00 and 5:00, from today until Friday; we break
18 for lunch; lunch will be provided. And we will also take
19 breaks as much as we need to have, we will take health
20 breaks, coffee breaks and if people need to stretch their
21 legs, those kinds of things; we have some coffee,
22 refreshments.

23 Now I have one more item here, it says
24 before I proceed to ENR's presentation are there any
25 other preliminary or legal issues? I do not think we

1 need to go through that, do we, John...?

2 Okay. We will dispense with that and we
3 can get right into ENR's presentation now.

4

5 (BRIEF PAUSE)

6

7 PRESENTATION BY ENR:

8 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Good morning. I am
9 just going to try a couple of words in Slavey first, I
10 hope you can understand it. Dagohte. Nezo. Sizi Susan
11 Sededi. So that is it for Slavey.

12 I will go to English. My name is Susan
13 Fleck, and I live in Yellowknife, I am Director of
14 Wildlife with the Department of Environment and Natural
15 Resources. I would like to introduce the other staff
16 that we have here today.

17 So over here is Alasdair Veitch, he is the
18 Manager, or he is the Supervisor of Wildlife Management
19 for the Sahtu Region, most of you know him.

20 To my left is Marsha Branigan, she is the
21 Manager of Wildlife Management in the Inuvik Region.

22 To my right is Boyan Tracz, the Cumulative
23 Effects Biologist in the Sahtu Region.

24 And over there by the computer is Jan
25 Adamczewski, we just hired him as the Ungulate Specialist

1 in Yellowknife and some of you may remember him from 1997
2 when he was the first biologist hired for the Board.

3 Our presentation will probably take about
4 forty-five (45) minutes, and will cover the following
5 areas:

6 How are barren-ground caribou herds
7 defined;

8 Why are herds the basis for management;
9 What information is collected to track the
10 population cycle;

11 What other factors affect individual herd
12 size;

13 What do we know about the harvest of
14 Bluenose-West Caribou?

15 What have we heard at meetings and
16 workshops in the last two (2) years; and we'll also talk
17 about different levels of harvest and other management
18 actions that have been taken in other areas.

19 The Panel will take turns making this
20 presentation, so, you will hear from all of us.

21 The land claim agreements make reference
22 to developing management actions and plans for individual
23 caribou herds. For example, the Sahtu Dene and Metis
24 Comprehensive Agreement refers to preparing a management
25 plan for Bluenose Caribou.

1 Traditional knowledge says that caribou
2 cows go to the same areas to calf. By following caribou
3 movements, biologists say that animals that use the same
4 areas and calving area form a herd.

5 This slide shows the movements of cows
6 with satellite collars from seven (7) herds used by NWT
7 communities. If you start on the left-hand side from the
8 west: The light green area is the Porcupine herd; and
9 then the red area are the movements of the Cape Bathurst
10 herd; the -- the sort of purpley-blue is the Bluenose-
11 West herd; the light purple too is the Bluenose-East
12 herd; the dark green is the Bathurst herd; the yellow on
13 top is the Dolphin Union that moves from the mainland up
14 to Victoria Island; and then to the far right, the blue
15 is the Ahiak or Queen Maud Gulf Herd.

16 Based on the collar data, there's no
17 evidence in the last ten (10) years that large numbers of
18 animals have moved from one (1) herd to another, but
19 there is some overlap between herds in certain seasons,
20 and there's no overlap when they have their calves.

21 We define calving grounds as the area
22 occupied by pregnant barren-ground Caribou from calf
23 birth through the initiation of foraging by calves. Each
24 June caribou cows from each herd will meet where they
25 were born. And in the last ten (10) years, the movements

1 of three hundred and six (306) have been followed over
2 two or more calving seasons.

3 To date, 98 percent of those cows have
4 returned to the same calving grounds. And you get some
5 idea on that map of where the calving grounds are from
6 where all the blue dots are.

7 We are sometimes asked, why manage by
8 herds, why not manage all the caribou in the Northwest
9 Territories together?

10 We manage by herds for two (2) main
11 reasons: First, some conditions differ on each caribou's
12 range, such as snow, forest fires, predation, and human
13 activity, including hunting.

14 Second, each herd is used by different
15 communities, and we want to make sure that all
16 communities have access to caribou.

17 For these reasons, it's important to
18 collect information about each herd. Biologists use
19 several types of information gathered over several years
20 to see if a herd is increasing or decreasing. We look at
21 what we hear from people in the communities who spend the
22 most time with caribou.

23 We look at the last few counts of a herd,
24 and we look at other information collected more often,
25 such as calf survival, pregnancy rates, condition, adult

1 sex ratio, and distribution. I'll now turn it over to
2 Boyan.

3 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: Good morning. Let's
4 look at two (2) examples of the type of monitoring we are
5 doing for barren-ground Caribou in the Sahtu.

6 Winter distribution of our barren-ground
7 herds has been surveyed over the last several years. For
8 these surveys, people from the Sahtu communities were
9 involved as observers, including Terry Edibar, Charles
10 Gully, Charles Kochon, Trudy Kochon from Colville, Johnny
11 Vital and Jimmy Dillon from Deline, and Jay Stevens from
12 Normal Wells.

13 If we compared the distribution of the
14 caribou on the transect lines with the location of
15 satellite-collared animals, we find that the satellite
16 collars give a good indication of the total distribution
17 of caribou in each herd.

18 During these flights, we also collect
19 information on other animals seen, such as wolves, moose,
20 or muskox. Hunters also help us collect information on
21 body condition, which hunters know is important for over
22 winter calf survival and for cows to have healthy calves.
23 In 2004, we began a program in Deline for hunters to collect
24 and store samples from animals they harvest.

25 Bruce Kenny and Chris Yukon were the

1 wildlife health monitors. We started the same program in
2 2005 in Colville Lake with Richard Kochon, Joseph Kochon,
3 and Terry Edibar as the wildlife health monitors.

4 Hunters judge the overall condition of the
5 animals and take measurements on back fat. This slide
6 shows that in 2004 and 2005 most caribou near Deline were
7 in good shape over the winter, but, in 2006 few animals
8 were in good shape. The information from 2005 on the
9 Bluenose-West caribou was similar.

10 This fall we also began to collect samples
11 from the fall hunt at Horton Lake. We did not collect
12 information on condition before 2004. Hunters can tell
13 us a lot about how caribou are doing and this information
14 helps to understand why caribou numbers are decreasing or
15 increasing.

16 So how do we count Bluenose-West herd?
17 It's important that we take a look at a year in the life
18 of barren-ground caribou herd to explain why we count
19 them in July out on the tundra.

20 So this animation is one that some of you
21 have -- have seen before shows how our barren-ground
22 caribou herds use the land through one calendar year.
23 We've taken multiple years of data for each herd and
24 combined them.

25 The -- the main thing to see here is that

1 each herd comes together in large groups in July after
2 the calving season, and we'll pause. You can see them
3 moving up to the calving grounds. So right about there.
4 So the main thing here is to see that each herd comes
5 together in large groups in July after the calving
6 season. At this time the males, females, and young are
7 all north of the tree-line on the open tundra where food
8 is good.

9 Now in the fall we should note that there
10 is mixing of the herds on their range, and we'll pause
11 here. So you can see in the fall there is some mixing.
12 You can continue. So that's a year in the life of a
13 caribou herd.

14 Now to do a photographic census we want
15 hot and buggy days so that the caribou bunch up. This is
16 usually the first or second week of July. We did a photo
17 -- we did photograph accounts of the Bluenose-West
18 caribou in 2005 and again in 2006.

19 Now to find the herd we use radio collared
20 animals. To do a survey we have to have about sixty (60)
21 to seventy (70) collars on both bulls and cows. We take
22 pictures from an airplane using a high quality -- using
23 high quality cameras and lenses, and then take all the
24 pictures back to our offices and count them on our
25 computers. We get much more accurate numbers using this

1 procedure compared with trying to count them from the
2 aircraft.

3 In July the caribou form large groups.
4 For example, there are three hundred and sixty-nine (369)
5 caribou in this group. If you were counting from the air
6 you could never be this accurate. By using digital
7 cameras we can enlarge the picture so that we do not
8 count calves as adults by mistake. The population
9 estimate only includes animals that are older than one
10 year. This is a standard practice for caribou herds
11 across North America because many calves die in their
12 first year and only a portion of calves seen in June and
13 July will be alive in the subsequent year.

14 Let's take a brief look at how many
15 caribou we estimated were in the Bluenose-West herd in
16 2005 and 2006. We have used the same technique to count
17 the Bluenose-West herd for about twenty (20) years.

18 This information tells us that the herd
19 numbers have declined from about a hundred thousand
20 (100,000) in 1987 to about eighteen thousand (18,000) in
21 2006. The Cape Bathurst and Bluenose-East herds have
22 shown a similar trend. Susan will now talk about caribou
23 population cycles.

24 MS. SUSAN FLECK: We're often asked if
25 herd sizes vary over time. Biologists have been tracking

1 herd sizes in the Northwest Territories for about thirty-
2 five (35) years. However, the people who live on the
3 land have been following caribou numbers for a whole lot
4 longer. Just like lynx, and rabbits, mice, and
5 ptarmigan, the number of barren-ground caribou seem to
6 increase and decrease at relatively regular intervals.

7 The scientific information we've collected
8 over the past forty (40) years support the traditional
9 knowledge. We don't know why this happens, but it may be
10 linked to long-term climate patterns. Biologists in
11 Alaska have interviewed people and looked at historical
12 records and recorded similar cycles over the last hundred
13 fifty (150) years for at least five (5) caribou herds in
14 Alaska.

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

17

18 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Earlier I said we think
19 caribou cycles may be linked to long-term climate
20 patterns but I also said conditions on each herd's range
21 differ. These conditions effect the overall size of each
22 herd.

23 We divide the factors that affect
24 individual herd size into those that cause direct or
25 indirect impacts. An example of a factor with an

1 indirect impact is when people say that caribou don't
2 like certain smells and will move away. In other words,
3 these factors rarely cause the death of a caribou but
4 they may affect how fat a caribou is or its behaviour.

5 Mining and oil and gas activity seem to
6 have local affects on caribou distribution especially
7 cows and calves in the summer. For such activity
8 communities and biologists recommend actions for
9 companies to minimize disturbance such as not operating
10 during peak migration.

11 We don't know what will happen as the
12 amount of activity increases. This is called cumulative
13 effects and we agree with communities we need to know
14 more about this. At this point it seems any impacts from
15 development will act indirectly on herd size and may be
16 relatively minor compared to harvest and predation which
17 do effect herd size directly.

18 For Bluenose-West caribou we've heard
19 people say there are more wolves and bears. We do record
20 the number of wolves and bears seen on surveys, but we
21 don't have population estimates. We do know from other
22 studies and traditional knowledge that wolves need
23 caribou to live and if there's less caribou, there will
24 be fewer wolves.

25 Alasdair will now talk about caribou

1 harvest in Sahtu.

2

3 (BRIEF PAUSE)

4

5 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: The Sahtu
6 settlement harvest study was included in the
7 implementation plan for the Sahtu Comprehensive Land
8 Claim Agreement. It was a major project of the Sahtu
9 Renewable Resources Board from 1998 through to its
10 completion in 2005.

11 The results show that harvest decreased
12 from about three thousand (3,000) caribou in 1999 to
13 about fourteen hundred (1,400) caribou in 2005. The
14 location of harvest was compared to the traditional
15 ranges of the Bluenose-East and Bluenose-West herds to
16 estimate how many caribou were harvested from each herd.
17 About one-quarter (1/4) ...

18

19 (BRIEF PAUSE)

20

21 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: About one-quarter
22 (1/4) of the annual Sahtu harvest is from the Bluenose-
23 West herd. We do not know why the harvest declined, but
24 we do know that in the later years of the harvest study
25 caribou were not as accessible.

1 This map shows where harvesting by Sahtu
2 beneficiaries took place between 1998 and 2003. It
3 should be noted that the Sahtu harvest study did not
4 record harvest by people from outside the Sahtu region.
5 Harvest was highest along winter roads and in the area
6 around Colville Lake where caribou traditionally winter.

7 The next few slides show the important
8 harvesting areas for each community. This slide is for
9 Colville Lake and it is for the same period 1998 to 2003.
10 Most of this harvest takes place in the traditional range
11 of the Bluenose-West caribou herd.

12 This slide shows the important harvest
13 areas for people from Fort Good Hope between 1998 and
14 2003. Most of their harvest is also within the range of
15 the Bluenose-West caribou herd.

16 This slide shows the important harvest
17 areas for people from Tulita between 1998 and 2003. Most
18 of their harvest is within the traditional range of the
19 other herd used by Sahtu people the Bluenose-East herd.

20 People from Norman Wells are generally
21 farthest away from barren-ground caribou. They harvest
22 from both the Bluenose-East and Bluenose-West herds;
23 therefore, the Norman Wells harvest was divided equally
24 between Bluenose-East and Bluenose-West herds.

25 This slide shows the important harvest

1 areas for people from Deline between 1998 and 2003.
2 During this period Deline had the highest harvest of all
3 Sahtu communities, and they hunt all around Great Bear
4 Lake. Almost all their harvest is within the traditional
5 range of the Bluenose-East caribou herd.

6 People in Deline have also recorded
7 harvest for over fifty (50) years and this information
8 shows that harvest can change a lot over time. Elders
9 will also recall years when caribou were hard to find and
10 Walter Bayha has spoken often at meetings about this
11 information.

12 The yellow shaded area in the lower right
13 part of the slide is the information collected during the
14 harvest -- the Sahtu harvest study.

15 This slide shows that harvest from the
16 Bluenose-West herd has declined considerably. For the
17 last two years the reported Bluenose-West harvest in the
18 Sahtu region averaged about three hundred and forty (340)
19 caribou.

20 For the last several years many of you
21 have seen this slide which shows that over the period of
22 the harvest study the harvest of cows increased. But if
23 we look at this information separated out for each herd,
24 we see a difference.

25 When we separated out the Bluenose-West

1 harvest, it looks like the ratio of cows harvested has
2 stayed about the same or about four (4) cows for every
3 six (6) bulls. So this is quite different from what was
4 happening with the Bluenose-East caribou.

5 In 2003 Inuvik and Sahtu regional staff
6 looked at the total 2002 harvest for Bluenose-West
7 caribou by all harvesters including resident and
8 nonresident hunters. You can see that subsistence
9 harvest is by far the most important.

10 At that time the only herd estimate we had
11 was from the count done in 2000 where the estimated herd
12 size was seventy-eight thousand (78,000) caribou. This
13 suggested that the total harvest was about 2.6 percent of
14 the herd. However, if the level of harvest in 2002 is
15 compared to the herd estimate of twenty thousand eight
16 hundred (20,800) caribou from 2005, then the harvest
17 would be about 9.2 percent of the herd. Generally, it is
18 thought that a herd that is increasing or stable can
19 sustain a harvest level of 3 to 5 percent.

20 In response to recommendations from the
21 Inuvialuit, Gwich'in and Sahtu wildlife co-management
22 boards ENR changed the laws so that all harvest by
23 resident and nonresident hunters was stopped in 2006.
24 Now, the only people who can harvest Bluenose-West
25 caribou are subsistence harvesters.

1 At current harvest levels, we estimate the
2 harvest is between 5 to 7 percent of the 2006 herd
3 estimate of eighteen thousand and fifty (18,050) caribou.
4 This should concern all of us. In response, the
5 Inuvialuit and Gwich'in have taken management actions
6 that will be discussed later in this presentation.

7 When we completed the counts in 2005, we
8 were surprised at the results. At the department we took
9 the approach that we would provide this information to
10 the wildlife co-management boards first, and then work
11 with the boards and communities to develop management
12 actions together.

13 I presented the information about the
14 census results to the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board in
15 September 2005. At the same time, this information was
16 also provided to the Inuvialuit Wildlife Management
17 Advisory Council and to the Gwich'in Renewable Resources
18 Board. At these meetings departmental staff suggested
19 that communities should consider reducing harvest among
20 other management actions. At the September 2005 meeting
21 the Sahtu board agreed that this information should be
22 provided to the Sahtu communities.

23 In October and November I went with Sahtu
24 board members or staff to all Sahtu communities and
25 schools. The results of what we heard at the meetings,

1 both the comments and the suggestions for management
2 actions, were presented by the executive director to the
3 Sahtu board in February 2006. After the 2006 counts, we
4 repeated the meetings in communities and schools.

5 The next set of slides show what was heard
6 at meetings in Inuvialuit, Gwich'in, and Sahtu
7 communities in 2005 and 2006. At the meetings people
8 talked about our survey methods, what people thought
9 about the decline in numbers of -- of the herds, about
10 the harvest information, and about what could be done to
11 help the herds increase in numbers.

12 This is what we heard about the survey
13 design. Some people suggested our technique misses
14 animals that might be in canyons or below tree line, and
15 that we should be using ground based methods instead of
16 aircraft. Also that we should be doing our counts in the
17 fall rather than on the post-calving areas.

18 We recognize there are different ways to
19 count caribou. Since 1987 we chose to use the July post-
20 calving photo census for the Bluenose-West and adjacent
21 herds because it provides an estimate of total herd size
22 when there is no overlap of range with other herds.
23 Because the Bluenose-West caribou are in the Inuvialuit
24 settlement region in July, these post-calving surveys
25 only included Inuvialuit observers. In the next survey

1 in 2009 we will try to find ways to have people from the
2 Sahtu come to see how we do these surveys.

3 During the meetings we heard lots of
4 comments about what may be causing caribou numbers to go
5 down. These included disturbance by development and by
6 researchers, and it was suggested we should be doing
7 studies on disturbance, diseases, and contaminants.

8 Some people raised the opinion that muskox
9 may be having a negative effect on caribou. Caribou
10 don't like the smell of the muskox and will stay away
11 from areas occupied by muskox. Many people commented on
12 changes to snow and overall winter conditions. This will
13 certainly have an impact on caribou movements, body
14 condition, and calf survival.

15 We were also asked what was happening with
16 other herds in the Northwest Territories and across the
17 range of caribou in North America. The subject of
18 predators was also often brought up. Some people said
19 there are more wolves and bears and that we should do
20 something about this. Others thought that predators are
21 a natural part of the system.

22 People were also wondering about changes
23 to migration. They see animals migrating at different
24 times than in the past and that conditions such as food
25 abundance and quality are changing on the herd ranges.

1 And many people told us that caribou numbers have always
2 fluctuated and that it is just part of a natural cycle.

3 Unfortunately, we do not have much
4 information on these different factors, but we plan to
5 collect more information in the future. One common
6 suggestion was to continue the harvest studies so we can
7 keep track of how many animals are being taken.

8 People also suggested using other animals
9 for food instead of relying so much on caribou. People
10 also said that we need to educate youth about caribou
11 including the wise use of caribou.

12 Other comments we heard were that the co-
13 management boards in the Inuvik and Sahtu regions would
14 need to come up with a means of allocating harvest if
15 harvest levels were to be reduced. People said there
16 should be monitors on winter roads when there are large
17 numbers of caribou present such as seen near Deline a few
18 years ago.

19 If there are quotas or tags, then the RRCs
20 in the Gwich'in and Sahtu areas and the hunters and
21 trappers committees in the Inuvialuit communities should
22 be in charge of allocating these tags.

23 People also pointed out that harvest
24 estimates don't include wounding loss. These are animals
25 that are hit by bullets but are not retrieved. Many of

1 these will later die of their wounds or become rather
2 easy prey for predators.

3 Most people were worried about the
4 caribou. They felt that caribou numbers had declined and
5 that we needed to do something quickly and that the
6 communities and boards need to work together. Most
7 people thought all harvest that was not subsistence
8 should be eliminated. Some people suggested we need
9 quotas for subsistence harvest until the herd recovers
10 its numbers. Others suggested that tags could be a way
11 of monitoring harvest levels.

12 Other suggestions heard were that it would
13 be good to reduce harvest of cows, and that we should
14 count the herds more often than every five (5) years.
15 People also suggested that exploration and development
16 should be restricted or eliminated in areas important to
17 caribou such as was done for the calving grounds of the
18 Bluenose-West herd and is being considered for Edaiila or
19 Caribou Point for the Bluenose-East herd.

20 People also said that if we restrict
21 harvesting, wildlife officers should be out more often
22 checking that the laws are followed. Some people are
23 worried that once you make changes to the laws it's hard
24 to change it back once things change. Others are worried
25 that it takes too long to get new laws in place.

1 People asked if there is to be a quota,
2 how would the number be determined? Marsha will now
3 speak about management actions taken in the Inuvialuit
4 and Gwich'in settlement areas.

5 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Sustainable harvest
6 can be thought of as the number of animals that can be
7 removed from a population by hunting without causing the
8 population to decline. However, when a herd is in
9 decline, there is no sustainable harvest. Instead we
10 have to consider the effects of different harvest levels
11 on the recovery of the herd.

12

13 (BRIEF PAUSE)

14

15 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: We did not do
16 projections from computer models specifically for the
17 Bluenose-West herd due to lack of data. But we can look
18 at the results from models for other herds, for example,
19 the Porcupine herd. These models tell us that, I'm
20 sorry, the higher the harvest of adult cows the longer it
21 takes for caribou numbers to increase.

22 As mentioned models of caribou populations
23 suggest that a sustainable harvest level of 3 to 5
24 percent in a population is stable or is increasing.
25 Although we know a lower harvest level would help caribou

1 to recover faster, we also know caribou is an important
2 food for communities. So when asked at meetings with
3 communities, we suggested that the maximum harvest should
4 be 3 percent of the population estimate and most of the
5 harvest should be bulls.

6 After listening to comments from
7 Inuvialuit communities in the fall of 2006 about a
8 suggested 3 percent harvest level, the Inuvialuit
9 Wildlife Management Advisory Council, NWT, recommended
10 that harvest should not exceed 4 percent of the herd and
11 that 80 percent of the harvest should be bulls. This
12 recommendation would be reviewed after the next herd
13 estimate in 2009.

14 The council recognized that this could
15 mean a slower recovery but still allow for some caribou
16 -- still allow some caribou for people to eat. The
17 council also recommended that the barren-ground caribou
18 management zones be changed to separate the core range of
19 the Bluenose-West herd from adjacent herds. These
20 recommendations were made by the council in October 2006
21 to the Minister of Environment and Natural Resources and
22 were provided to the Gwich'in and Sahtu Renewable
23 Resources Boards to review.

24 Rather than setting a total harvest level,
25 in law, the HTC bylaws require the use of a tag to hunt

1 caribou in the Bluenose-West range in the Inuvialuit
2 settlement region, and tags are provided to the HTC to
3 administer.

4 If the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board
5 were to adopt the WMAC recommendation to set the harvest
6 at 4 percent, this would be considered a total allowable
7 harvest. Using the two hundred and six (206) population
8 estimate for the Bluenose-West herd of eighteen thousand
9 and fifty (18,050) caribou and a 4 percent harvest rate,
10 the annual total allow -- allowable harvest would be
11 seven hundred and twenty-two (722) caribou.

12 The Inuvialuit Wildlife Management and
13 Advisory Council also recommended that the harvest should
14 be 80 percent bulls and 20 percent cows. The goal is to
15 try to get more calves into the population while not over
16 harvesting bulls. People in communities, particularly
17 Colville Lake, are concerned about over harvesting large
18 adult bulls. Biologists share that concern.

19 As the Bluenose-West herd is shared by
20 Sahtu, Gwich'in, and Inuvialuit harvesters, any total
21 allowable harvest must be divided among the regions. The
22 Bluenose Caribou Herd Management Cooperation Agreement
23 identifies who should be involved in making this
24 decision.

25 In August 2006 before a recommendation on

1 total allowable harvest was made, the chairs of the
2 Gwich'in, Inuvialuit, and Sahtu wildlife co-management
3 boards and the chair of the Tuktut Nogait National Park
4 Management Board met to discuss how to allocate a total
5 allowable harvest. The allocation was based on historic
6 harvest levels in the three (3) regions.

7 The decision was that it -- if a total
8 allowable harvest is established, the allocation should
9 be 48 percent of the harvest to the Inuvialuit
10 harvesters, 3 percent of the harvest to Gwich'in
11 harvesters, and 48 percent of the harvest to Sahtu
12 harvesters which would equal to three hundred and forty-
13 seven (347) caribou per year. This is close to the
14 average harvest reported for the last two (2) years of
15 the Sahtu harvest study.

16 In the Inuvik region we held a workshop on
17 impacts caused by the decline in caribou numbers. I
18 brought a few copies of the report from this workshop
19 called Walking Together for those interested. The
20 workshop helped to identify ways to reduce impacts on
21 people in the communities. While suggestions included
22 hunting other species for food, there were concerns about
23 increased pressures on those species. So participants
24 stressed the importance of collecting harvest data and
25 monitoring population trends of alternate food species.

1 Susan will now speak on the final few
2 slides.

3 MS. SUSAN FLECK: After -- after the
4 results of the herd counts in 2005, the Minister of
5 Environment and Natural Resources said he would develop a
6 five (5) year barren-ground caribou management strategy
7 for the entire Northwest Territories. This was released
8 in February 2006.

9 Actions in this strategy were based on
10 comments heard at community meetings and discussions with
11 wildlife co-management boards. This strategy was helpful
12 in obtaining additional funds to collect more information
13 for all caribou herds such as calf survival, condition,
14 and pregnancy rates, and also to do more public
15 education. Some of the extra funding is being used to
16 help the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board collect
17 traditional knowledge on hunting laws. Some copies of
18 the strategy are available at the table over there.

19 In January 2007 we organized a barren-
20 ground caribou summit in Inuvik that brought together
21 over two hundred (200) people from across the north with
22 an interest in the use and management of barren-ground
23 caribou.

24 Participants at the summit identified the
25 highest priority actions to help caribou herds recover

1 and to reduce hardships on people. Fifteen (15) people
2 from the S -- from the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board
3 and the renewable resource councils in Sahtu attended
4 this summit. The report from the summit has just been
5 released and copies are being sent to all delegates. I
6 also brought a few copies, and they're on the table over
7 there. We are acting on those recommendations that are
8 our responsibility as a government.

9 In the late 1990s regional staff worked
10 with the Gwich'in, Sahtu, Inuvialuit, and Nunavut co-
11 management boards and communities to develop a co-
12 management plan for the Cape Bathurst, Bluenose-West,
13 Bluenose-East caribou herds. The plan was recommended by
14 the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board, but now the plan
15 needs to be updated.

16 The department has funding to help boards
17 prepare a new plan for the Bluenose herds in consultation
18 with communities. We agree with Colville Lake that this
19 process should start as soon as possible. One issue that
20 should be looked at is whether the Sahtu caribou
21 management zones should be changed as was done in the
22 Inuvialuit region to better reflect where the herds go.

23 That completes our presentation, and we'll
24 be pleased to answer questions, mahsi cho.

25

1 QUESTION PERIOD:

2 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, mahsi, Susan and
3 your staff. Now like I said at the beginning, now once
4 the presentation by ENR is completed, we can go through
5 the questions. Starting with -- I just saw Richard leave
6 there, but we usually start with the Colville Lake Behdzi
7 Ahda' First Nations. So I know Richard is about here
8 somewhere --

9 Joseph, is Richard still out there? He's
10 -- ENR just finished their presentation, so the
11 questions, we have a period for questions, and we will
12 start with Joseph or with Richard. Richard is over here
13 for the Behdzi Ahda' First Nation.

14 And Richard is a Chief over there in the
15 Colville Lake, so if -- ENR has just finished their
16 presentation, so if you -- you know, you have time for
17 some questions now. And, you know, we have Alasdair,
18 Boyan, Susan, and a representative from the Inuvik, as
19 well, so. Okay.

20 Just make sure you -- you know, I do not
21 want to disrupt how you are going to say your stuff, but
22 there is translators there, so make sure everybody has
23 got their hearing aids on. Okay. Richard is going to
24 begin.

25

1 (NORTH SLAVEY TRANSLATED INTO ENGLISH)

2

3 CHIEF RICHARD KOCHON: ...Back in 1970,
4 they restricted the hunting of muskox and why is it that
5 this restrict -- restriction still in place to this day?
6 It will be good if they opened up a -- the hunting on the
7 muskox. And down there on Colville Lake we live amongst
8 the -- the caribou, and if were -- the numbers were down,
9 we would know that and the people that do this work. And
10 we've been telling them for a while now, and we ask them
11 that if one (1) if the community members could work with
12 them, and why is it that they're not following this
13 advice that we have given them?

14 And from now on, they should have at least
15 one (1) Aboriginal person working with them, that way we
16 could work better with one another. We are the ones that
17 really depend on the caribou. We grew up on caribou
18 meat, we never really lived off food from the store.

19 And there are caribou down in that carib
20 -- in Colville Lake area. And so we really -- the
21 caribou is a very important food source for us, and --
22 and we don't hunt more than we need, we just take what we
23 need. And if the caribou numbers were lessening, we
24 would know it.

25 And we wouldn't depend on other people to

1 tell us that the caribou numbers were down and tell us
2 how to manage the caribou. We travel out to the barren
3 lands, we -- it's like we visit the caribou lands. And
4 I, myself -- I dream about it sometimes.

5 And I dream about the caribou and I dream
6 that they are like humans, and one (1) of the things that
7 it really doesn't like -- the way I dream about it is li
8 -- noise is one (1) of the things that it doesn't like.
9 And they also ask what is the shovel for.

10 And so out on the barren land, sometimes
11 they go -- do exploration work for minerals and stuff,
12 maybe they shouldn't do those kind of work - maybe that's
13 one (1) of things that you should know, as well. I'm not
14 saying this for nothing.

15 And -- and they just talked about how they
16 did a recent count on the caribou, and one (1) of the
17 things they use when they count them is they fly over
18 them with choppers, and we ask them not to do this. The
19 caribou really don't like noise. And sometimes when the
20 helicopters are flying back and forth over the caribou
21 calving area sometimes it causes predators to come in and
22 kill a lot of the caribou.

23 And so the Sahtu Renewable Resources
24 Board, it would be good if they followed what the people
25 of the Sahtu region were telling them. We all live

1 amongst one another here.

2 And we, the people, way -- from way back,
3 our grandfathers, we all lived on caribou. Back then
4 there was a time when the caribou numbers were way down
5 but still, to this day, we still depend on caribou for
6 food and we still have caribou on our lands. And there
7 was a time when the caribou were very plentiful.

8 And they were talking about how the --
9 some of the caribou have gone to the Fort Rae area. Our
10 grandfathers spoke about that back when Alexis was born,
11 around that time and Alexis is now a pensioner and back
12 then when he was born the caribou from over there came
13 around to Colville Lake area.

14 And also with the muskox we are wondering
15 why the hunting of muskox is restricted. Maybe they
16 should open that up. Maybe if they did that it wouldn't
17 be necessary to talk about caribou if they did that.
18 That's good food there, too, the muskox.

19 And so at this time the counting that's
20 going on it's sort of like not really certain for us.
21 They talked about the -- it would be good if they have a
22 person from Colville and also from Deline working with
23 them when they do this type of work and then those
24 people, whose land it is, they're the ones that utilize
25 the lands and they would know better. That way they

1 would know better.

2 And I wish that you would really listen to
3 what we are saying and that's the only way that things
4 will go well with us and so that's all I want to say.

5 Thank you for listening to me. Mahsi.

6

7 (TRANSLATION CONCLUDED)

8

9 THE CHAIRPERSON: You know there might be
10 some questions and I'd like to remind, you know,
11 everybody here that's going to be talking, you do have --
12 you know you'll have your chance to do your own
13 presentations as well so, you know, I would try to
14 concentrate, you know, to question ENR stuff at this
15 time.

16 I hope ENR if you're listening there were
17 some questions in there, so, I hope you'll pick that up
18 and you can respond to Richard's questions and you --
19 okay. Thanks. Go ahead, Susan.

20 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. I
21 wrote down about four (4) questions and I'll provide some
22 answers and then maybe ask Alasdair too if he has some
23 additional comments.

24 The one (1) question was, why don't we
25 take community members with you -- with us when we go out

1 on surveys and we -- we haven't done the best job in
2 taking people with us and we realize that and in the
3 presentation when we do the next survey in 2009, we will
4 definitely make sure that people from Sahtu, from
5 Colville, Deline can come to see how this is done.

6 We have been able to take people out for
7 some of the distribution work and Alasdair may be able to
8 comment a little bit further on that.

9 There was another question about caribou
10 and noise and we have heard people talk about caribou and
11 noise and we know from when we do work on the calving
12 grounds that noise does bother them, too. We try to be
13 really careful and minimize that disturbance as much as
14 possible.

15 There was also a question about hunting
16 muskox. Muskox have been on the -- on the tundra for a
17 long time with caribou and I guess they've come into the
18 trees here recently. We have started a bit of hunting
19 and Alasdair can talk a little bit about that.

20 A long time ago there weren't many muskox
21 and so hunting was restricted on them. As they've been
22 increasing in numbers, as a department we have gone out
23 and done surveys and increased them -- the number that
24 people can hunt. I think it's a good question about the
25 restriction and it's something that should be talked

1 about when people talk about doing a management plan for
2 caribou.

3

4 (BRIEF PAUSE)

5

6 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Okay. Alasdair...?

7 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: Alasdair Veitch
8 with ENR. In response to the first question that Susan
9 was talking about use of the community observers, as we
10 indicated in the presentation, Susan indicated, for the
11 winter distribution surveys when we've been flying out of
12 Colville Lake and Deline we have taken people from
13 Colville Lake and Deline on those surveys.

14 ENR policy -- because we generally have
15 fairly small aircraft is to use one (1) or two (2)
16 observers from the community actually in the aircraft
17 with us and that tends to be whichever community we're
18 working out of. And that's why, as we said, in July
19 we're flying out of Paulatuk for Bluenose-west Caribou.

20 And we've been using observers from there
21 but now at meetings of biologists, and under Susan's
22 guidance, she has come up with ideas for how we can
23 include more people in the census work up on the tundra.
24 So, we could have aircraft go up to Paulatuk and also to
25 Kugluktuk where we do the surveys for the Bluenose-east

1 Caribou and we could have people from the different
2 communities see what it is we're doing, how we're doing
3 it; that type of thing.

4 So we -- we do recognize that people want
5 to see what we're doing and we're going to be working
6 towards making that happen and Susan says that the
7 Department will make sure we have the funding to make
8 that happen.

9 In terms of muskox hunting, musk ox -- as
10 Richard Kochon referred to, muskox hunting was banned
11 across Canada in 1917 -- total ban of all muskox hunting
12 by all people because muskox numbers were very, very low
13 at that time. And the area north of Great Bear Lake was
14 probably one (1) of the areas where muskox populations
15 were maintained.

16 Over the 1970s/1980s muskox populations,
17 their numbers started to recover to the point where in
18 1991/1992 when Paul Latour was in the job that I'm in
19 now, the Department - at that time it was the Department
20 of Renewal Resources - in response to requests from the
21 communities reinstated muskox hunting in the Sahtu and
22 they had decided to put muskox on a tag system so they
23 could regulate the number of animals being taken because
24 people were very -- wanted to make sure we didn't take
25 too many muskox to let the populations recover.

1 So in 1991/'92 the -- the harvest level
2 was set at eleven (11) muskox per year, ten (10) of which
3 were for Aboriginal subsistence harvesters in the
4 communities, one (1) for resident hunters.

13

14 (BRIEF PAUSE)

15

16 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: As a result of that
17 survey we increased the quota and tags from eleven (11)
18 per year for Sahtu to twenty-seven (27) and the Renewable
19 Resources Board worked with the RRCs on an allocation
20 scheme for those tags such that twenty-five (25) were for
21 subsistence harvest and two (2) for resident hunters and
22 that's the quota that remains in place to today.

23 We have not had any year so far where
24 we've even come close to filling the quota. Most years
25 we're well under ten (10) animals being taken, so, there

1 -- there are still many muskox hunting opportunities in
2 the Sahtu under the current quota and if a new survey was
3 done, we certainly could look at increasing that quota in
4 future.

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

7

8 THE CHAIRPERSON: You've got one (1)
9 more? You're pretty well finished there? Okay.

10 Maybe at this time I'm going to remind
11 everybody that, you know, you have the times allotted. I
12 mean, we're trying to organize our time here so check
13 with me. We're going to take a maybe a what, fifteen
14 (15) minute -- ten (10); a ten (10) minute break there.
15 The Board's here, need to stretch your legs. So a ten
16 (10) minute break and then we have Richard -- or Wilbert.
17 Okay? That's going to be talking -- that's a question
18 period, okay?

19 Okay, Joseph, for Ayoni Keh Land
20 Corporation? Okay. Well, let me just speak to you
21 during the break and we'll sort this out. Okay. Break
22 time then.

23

24 --- Upon recessing at 11:19 a.m.
25 --- Upon resuming at 11:38 a.m.

1 THE CHAIRPERSON: We were dealing with
2 these questions for ENR after their presentation but in
3 the morning when I went through the opening remarks maybe
4 I should have been a little more specific on how the
5 Boards came to be on the...

6 I introduce him this morning but Robert
7 here and Camilla and Rose are all SSI nominees which is
8 First Nations and they mainly came, I guess, through
9 their First Nations and probably through their land
10 corporations. They get nominated and then the Minister
11 appoints them. We also have Keith here, that's a nominee
12 from the GNWT and also Paul here to my left here that's a
13 nominee from Environment Canada. Remember what I said,
14 half First nations, half government; that's what I was
15 talking about.

16 Anyway, let's -- dinner's going to be at
17 twelve o'clock so we'll try to get through most of the
18 questioning. We still have First Nations questioning
19 here. I think we've got Joseph here with Behdzi Ahda
20 First Nations. So, like I said, Joseph's -- say your
21 name and organization you represent for our record.

22 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: Joseph Kochon, Behdzi
23 Ahda First Nation. I just had a question -- a few
24 questions for ENR. I just wanted to know what is the
25 distance between the flight pattern when they do their

1 count or the distance? I know they fly in grids and the
2 length, so that was my -- my first question.

12 I guess my third question was: How long
13 did the Bluenose-East existed? I know -- for the longest
14 time we know that Bluenose-West is what we've been
15 dealing with but then not too long ago we started hearing
16 about Bluenose-East so I'm just wondering somehow maybe
17 our herd kind of split up or something like that. So,
18 I'm just wondering how that was determined, you know,
19 Bluenose-East and Bluenose-West.

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Maybe if I interrupt.
21 It might be better for you and for all of us as well and
22 for myself as well to keep track of things. Maybe we ask
23 the questions, get an answer, ask another question, get
24 an answer that would be easier for us.

25 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: Okay. Whichever way

1 you want to take it, Mr. Chair.

2 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay. Thanks, Joseph.

3 So the first question was distance between the flight --
4 I think he's talking about the transect, I guess. Is it
5 okay with ENR?

6

7 (BRIEF PAUSE)

8

9 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. We
10 wrote all three (3) questions down and we'll start with
11 the last question first and we're trying to get a slide
12 up that shows movements from satellite collars and Marsha
13 will address that question and then Boyan and Alasdair
14 will answer the other two (2).

15 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Joseph, it's Marsha
16 Branigan with ENR in Inuvik. That's a good question
17 about how long has the Bluenose-East herd existed.

18 Back in around 1993 that's when I first
19 started working for -- it wasn't ENR back then but for
20 the Department. We used to call it the Bluenose herd and
21 for the long -- I mean that's what your claim even talks
22 about is the Bluenose herd.

23 In about 1993 John Nagy who was the
24 Supervisor of Wildlife Management at the time took all
25 the historic information from all the different surveys

1 that had been done over time and Paul was involved in a
2 lot of those surveys and plotted them all. This is when
3 we started to get a geographic information system so we
4 could put them all on a map and put them all, layer them
5 all on top of each other.

6 And it indicated that there was -- over
7 time we were actually seeing calving happening in three
8 (3) different areas but, historically, we were not
9 surveying all those areas adequately to get an overall
10 picture of what was going on with all those three (3)
11 areas. So in 1996, that's when we first deployed
12 satellite collars on animals and we tried to put ten (10)
13 collars out on animals that we thought were going to go
14 up and calve on the Cape Bathurst area, ten (10) collars
15 on animals that we thought were going to go and calve in
16 Tuktu Nogait or in the Bluenose-West area and ten (10)
17 animals that we thought were going to end up over by
18 Kugluktuk.

19 That's the beginning of this map that
20 you're seeing on the screen now that those three (3)
21 areas in the middle, the red lines, are the Cape
22 Bathurst, the dark blue are the Bluenose-West, and the
23 pink are the Bluenose-East. So in 1996 we started to
24 collect information. By 1999 we'd also done some genetic
25 analysis and it indicated that there's actually three (3)

1 different sort of calving areas. They're all going --
2 all those collars went to separate areas.

3 As we mentioned in our presentation there
4 is occasional crossover but they're generally going back
5 to the same area where they -- they calved the year
6 before and that's how we came up with the three (3)
7 different herds. So starting in about 1999 when we
8 developed the -- the management plan that was signed,
9 that's when we started managing based on three (3)
10 different herds. I hope that answers your question.

11 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: That's just about how
12 long the -- this data was available so I guess the other
13 two (2) question -- I wasn't finished my questions, Mr.
14 Chairman, so you can answer the other two (2) questions.

15 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: Boyan Tracz, ENR. The
16 first question I believe you were asking about the
17 spacing on the -- on the lines; is that correct when we
18 do...

19 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: The -- the distance
20 between the flight pattern when you're doing a count.

21 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: When we're doing a
22 count?

23 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: Yeah.

24 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: Okay.

25 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: I'm -- I'm pretty

1 sure you fly straight lines, grids, then back, so, I need
2 to know the distance between. Do you have a graph on
3 on there?

4 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: Okay.

5 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: Just asking about the
6 distance between each flight pattern.

7 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: Okay. So I'll -- I'll
8 clarify the distance on the transect lines that we have
9 in our -- in our different flights that we do.

10 So the slide that's up there right now,
11 that's showing winter distribution flights. Now, on
12 those transect lines we're not doing counts. That's not
13 the photo census but I'll just talk to that -- talk to
14 that first.

15 So with those ones, the blue lines, those
16 are your -- your set transect lines and they're 20
17 kilometres apart usually -- 20 kilometres apart.

18 Now, those ones aren't for the -- the
19 specific photo census counts of the caribou and are
20 spaced at 20 kilometres to be able to see where the
21 caribou are -- yeah, to be able to -- to see where the
22 caribou are so that when we put out our collars, we
23 distribute them over the entire distribution of the
24 caribou

25 And where we saw the caribou on those

1 flight lines, for example, are the -- are the red dots
2 and the bigger the red dots and the closer they are
3 together is where the most caribou are. So that's for
4 the winter distribution before we put out the collars.

5 Now, your question asked about the spacing
6 on the actual calving ground photo census surveys. When
7 we first start our photo census surveys we do do transect
8 lines and we can space those at 20 kilometres or 10
9 kilometres. We've -- we've done both.

10 We initially covered the entire area that
11 historically we know is -- is the calving ground for the
12 different herd and that's to get an initial idea of where
13 the caribou can be both visually from the tracks that we
14 see and the caribou that we see, but, also to use the
15 radio collars that we have out there as guides to where
16 the caribou may be. So we're flying up and on those
17 transect lines that you're speaking of and we're
18 listening for where the collars would be. So that's
19 before the photo census actually starts.

20 When we've done those transect lines and
21 we've found all the collars that we possibly can find, as
22 well as groups that we know don't have any collar in
23 them, we then return day after day to those same areas
24 and we follow those different groups over time. So after
25 the initial transect lines when we've found everything

1 that we can cover the entire area that they could be
2 calving, we then go back and we -- we follow those
3 individual groups not on the transect but flying straight
4 to where we saw them before and following the tracks to
5 where they could be now.

6 Now, when we're doing that I can tell you
7 that every morning for Bluenose-East I can speak
8 specifically, we were in the office talking with for
9 example Allan Niptinatiuk or Collin Adjiun who you may
10 even know from the fiddle playing that he does and these
11 are people who have lived out in the -- at least the
12 Bluenose-East area for -- for their entire lives and you
13 could ask as to where else we should look or what their
14 opinion is as to where else we could go to make sure that
15 we're finding -- finding the caribou.

16 So for winter specific spacing on the --
17 on the transect lines, before we put out the collars, and
18 on the -- the actual -- those -- those flight lines, you
19 can see initially there's up and down transect lines but
20 then those big blobs of blue, that's basically where we
21 flew back day after day after day to follow the caribou
22 and that's July so that's -- it's kind of a combination
23 then, transect as well as specifically finding the groups
24 we found thanks to the transects and help from the -- the
25 officers who were also community members. I hope -- does

1 that answer?

2 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: A bit. I'll just go
3 on to my next question.

4 Earlier Richard mentioned that -- why
5 community members were not involved and I guess the --
6 the post-planning of caribou count especially if it's a
7 Bluenose-West, you know, we know that we live right in
8 the Bluenose-West. You know, they come by and say hello
9 to us every now and then and it's just that why haven't
10 the community been involved in that whole planning
11 process, you know? It's just that -- I guess that's the
12 point that we're trying to make earlier.

13

14 (BRIEF PAUSE)

15

16 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, go ahead, Sue.

17 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. Joseph, I
18 -- I just want to make sure I heard the question right
19 and you were asking about being involved in planning for
20 the -- the summer surveys?

21 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: Yeah. Maybe I could
22 just rephrase. Every time there's a -- there's a plan to
23 do a count, you know, 2009 there's going to be a count.
24 But then we're not involved, you know, we're the direct
25 users, you know.

1 It's just from yourself. You make a
2 proposal to the Renewable Resources Board that, okay,
3 it's going to cost this much money to -- to conduct a
4 count.

5 But as a community, you know, you're kind
6 of making a decision over -- over us. You know, where
7 you're just biologists that live in Norman Wells or
8 Inuvik. We're not involved so that's the missing gap
9 that we're -- I guess the Chief was trying to ask
10 earlier. Thanks.

11

12 (BRIEF PAUSE)

13

14 THE CHAIRPERSON: Go ahead.

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

17

18 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. We
19 haven't -- you're right, we haven't done that in the past
20 and we recognize that we need to work closer with the
21 community in the future and we're going to try and find -
22 - figure out how -- how we can do that so that people are
23 more aware of what the plans are and go over the plans
24 before we present them to the Boards.

25 Marsha, do you want to --

1 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: I was just going to
2 mention that it -- it -- for this herd, in particular,
3 it's difficult for ENR because the herd is cross-
4 boundary. And we have to deal with both the Inuvik
5 Region, the Sahtu Region.

6 The Inuvik Region has Inuvial (phonetic)
7 and Gwich'In. So we are trying to deal with all the
8 communities and you have to get -- try to get input from
9 all the different communities in order to do your
10 studies.

11 We put our plans before the WMAC and the
12 GRB in our area and Alasdair puts his plans before the
13 Sahtu Boards. And those Boards are made up of
14 representatives from the different RRCs basically.

15 We also in our area go to the Game Council
16 which your -- your claim doesn't have quite the same
17 thing. But it's a representative from each of the HTC'S
18 and we've also lately been trying to go to each community
19 once a year and describe all the things that we're
20 planning to do; not just with regards to caribou but
21 other research as well. But one of the things that we
22 can think about is the management plan.

23 When we do the management, it hopefully
24 will set out a lot of the monitoring and the studies that
25 we think should be done over time. And that would be

1 pre-planned.

2 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Marsha.

3 You've got some more questions, I guess, hey, Joseph?

4 MR. JOSEPH KOCHON: Yeah. Thanks.

5 Another question that I think you almost answered it, you
6 know. The caribou are almost like humans, you know,
7 sometimes we migrate to different areas.

8 Sometimes if we don't like the winter we
9 go to a warm area. And, you know, you could see there
10 it's hard to make a determination, so, whatever data you
11 collect, you know, I'm sure you've done the best you
12 could.

13 I guess in the -- I guess the future we're
14 asking that we are here, we exist, we lived here for
15 thousands of years and just recognize us as people that
16 live here and, you know, we have -- I'm sure some of you
17 are scientists.

18 We have our knowledge that we brought here
19 from Colville Lake and I just wanted to make you aware
20 that we exist, not only your scientists can make that
21 ruling so. In my presentation, you'll hear about that.
22 Thanks.

23 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Joseph. We, you
24 know, we're going to go down the list here. I -- I
25 mentioned to Wilbert during the break that he'll have a

1 chance to question ENR's presentation.

2 Wilbert is back there somewhere? Wilbert
3 and Alvin for both -- for Ayoni Keh Land Corporation.

4 MR. WILBERT KOCHON: I need an hour.

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: You need an hour?

6 You're probably -- we're going to have lunch I guess at
7 12:00 right? So why don't we start -- at least start and
8 when lunch comes then we can break.

9 And remember questions for ENR. You'll
10 have your turn on the presentations later on, so, we'll
11 try to focus on questions for ENR.

12 MR. WILBERT KOCHON: Wilbert Kochon,
13 President of the Land Corporation, Colville Lake. I
14 never really had questions. I just wanted to make a
15 presentation but Alvin's supposed to do that, I think he
16 ran out.

17 But I think Joseph answered -- asked all
18 the questions he needed to ask so -- but I'm going to
19 speak later on my own presentation. I don't really have
20 any questions. Joseph asked all the questions already
21 so.

22 But there's a lot of things that I want to
23 talk about that the Board needs to hear and, you know, or
24 has to hear. So that's all I have to say for now because
25 I want to have lunch too.

6 MR. ALVIN ORLIAS: Good morning, good
7 morning. We did have some questions, unfortunately, my
8 paperwork didn't make it over here with me. But just
9 listening to Joseph this morning I think most of the
10 questions that we were going to ask, he's asked.

11 And I believe most of them were answered
12 and we'll just go to the presentation that Wilbert's
13 going to make later and then from there we're going to go
14 on and I'm -- I'm sure we can come to some kind of
15 conclusion today hopefully, right.

16 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Alvin. That was
17 good. We also have on our list the Behdzi Ahda'
18 Renewable Resource Council but as far as I know, the
19 Chief and -- and Joseph were speaking on their behalf as
20 well.

Also remember that they have their own presentation to make so. Okay, that's later on and David Codzi is going to be speaking on behalf of the Renewable Resource Council of Behdzi Ahda' later on as well.

Okay we also, you know, on -- on, you

1 know, I keep reminding people that you have your own
2 presentations to make so you'll have, you know, the time
3 you need to -- to go over your stuff.

4 This is only for questions for ENR that
5 maybe some things that you want to clarify, some things
6 that you want to bring up that they can respond to at
7 this time.

8 You know, we're getting to an area here,
9 you know, the Colville Lake Elders, Colville Lake
10 community members, should we get into that -- I wonder
11 where the lunch is going to be.

12 Well, for -- for the Elders for that, I --
13 I know I talked to them and a lot of this stuff is very
14 confusing, so, I don't know if they want to -- to
15 questions. I think they'd rather have their -- their
16 time and then do -- do their presentations or their talk
17 later on today.

18 MR. WILBERT KOCHON: Some of the Elders
19 want to ask some questions now.

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Oh, okay. By all
21 means. That's what this slot of time is for and if they
22 -- they want to ask questions ENR.

23

24 (BRIEF PAUSE)

25

1 MR. WILBERT KOCHON: It's hard for them
2 to question because they kind of tell a story, so, it's
3 kind of hard for them to ask questions.

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: I -- I understand that
5 and I -- you know, I go through that quite often. I know
6 what you're talking about. They'd rather tell their
7 story and have their time rather than have a
8 question/answer period.

9 The -- the -- maybe -- maybe what we can
10 do at this time is if we have any of the Renewable
11 Resources Council other than Colville Lake here, you
12 know, they would have their chance to question as well.

13 But if -- but I don't think anybody from
14 Good Hope is here with the RRC.

15 MR. JIM TOBAC: Can I ask a few
16 questions?

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: You're with...? We --
18 we can -- yeah, I think -- I'm checking off here. I'm
19 down to that portion anyway, so, yeah. I don't -- I
20 asked about -- the RRCs here, RRCs everywhere, they're
21 not here so, yes, just state your name and...

22 MR. JIM TOBAC: Jim Tobac, hunter. Okay,
23 my questions are -- when you're doing your studies, has
24 any collared caribou been picked up on the west side of
25 the river, McKenzie?

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

2

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Go ahead.

4 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. No
5 barren-ground caribou collars have been on the west side.

6 MR. JIM TOBAC: I'm asking this because
7 has hunters and trappers been across that side of the
8 McKenzie. There's hundreds of caribou tracks believed to
9 be barren-ground caribou.

10 I trapped in the mountains on the Ramparts
11 River, between Rampart River and the Arctic Red River
12 years ago and I think it was 1986. In those years there
13 was thousands of caribou up there. And some of us
14 believe there's still thousands of caribou up there.

15

16 (BRIEF PAUSE)

17

18 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: Yeah, thanks for
19 the question. It's Alasdair Veitch, ENR. Referring to
20 the 1986 -- back at that time all the herds were at peak
21 numbers.

22 We've heard from people in communities as
23 far south as Tulita that the Porcupine caribou herd which
24 is the light green one up on the upper lefthand part of
25 that slide, that at that time members of the Porcupine

1 herd came down along the McKenzie River as far south as
2 the McKenzie Mountains.

3 And some people in Tulita have told us
4 that they were even in the McKenzie Mountains at that
5 time. But we haven't observed that, certainly with the
6 collar data we haven't seen that in the last twenty (20)
7 years since we've been putting these satellite collars
8 on.

9 And again, none of the satellite collars
10 we've put on any of the herds east of the river have
11 crossed the river. But we have heard from other hunters
12 that -- that does occur. But none of our collars are
13 showing that right now for barren-ground caribou.

14 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: Boyan Tracz, ENR. With
15 regards to your comments about the tracks and the
16 Ramparts on the west side, you're absolutely right.

17 There's -- there's caribou out there. We
18 currently have collars on -- on Boreal Woodland caribou
19 out in the Ramparts and certainly up by, you know, Kelly
20 Hogan's (phonetic) camp and other areas there in the
21 foothills.

22 We have seen thousands of Mountain
23 Woodland caribou there as well. So you're -- you're
24 right about caribou being in those areas and -- and using
25 those areas.

1 We classify those as the Mountain Woodland
2 and Boreal Woodland caribou though, not the -- not the
3 Barren-ground herds that you see on the map right there.

4 MR. JIM TOBAC: I think I know the
5 difference between Woodland and barren-ground.

6 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: I mean no disrespect in
7 any way, shape or form. But we have the -- the collar
8 information from our -- our Boreal isn't -- isn't on that
9 map. So it's -- it's just not presented on -- on that
10 because it's barren-ground caribou.

11 MR. JIM TOBAC: Was there -- shouldn't
12 there be more studies to see if this is a cycle? Because
13 speaking to my sister-in-law in the '70's in Aklavik
14 there was no caribou. People lived off the rein --
15 reindeer. It was some years later that they came back.

16 So shouldn't there be more studies to see
17 if there's a cycle?

18 THE CHAIRPERSON: Go ahead, Susan.

19 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck -- Susan
20 Fleck, ENR. Like you, lots of people have told us that
21 caribou numbers go up and down.

22 We've talked about this down in the -- in
23 the North Slave region a bit and the difference between -
24 - in the -- in the '70s when caribou numbers were low the
25 last time.

1 In -- in the north -- in the -- in that
2 dark green area, we had no winter roads then at that
3 time. The -- snow machines weren't very good yet so
4 people weren't able to follow them. They were using dog
5 teams still to hunt caribou and they could get to them
6 but not as well.

7 We didn't have collars on the caribou that
8 people now look on the map to see where they are to go
9 hunting. And we didn't have as much exploration activity
10 then in -- in the caribou area as we do now.

11 So now -- at this point it's -- it's our
12 feeling that -- that caribou numbers are low again. But
13 people are able to get two (2) caribou and there's way
14 more activity on the caribou range and that's why we're
15 more worried about what's going on with caribou.

16 We think they will come back in number but
17 we're trying to find ways to make sure that will happen.

18 MR. JIM TOBAC: Just a couple of more
19 questions. The other one was, should -- do you think
20 there should be a wolf and bear count? The reason I'm
21 saying this is I noticed in the past three (3) four (4)
22 years there's wolves all over around here.

23 And a couple of years ago we went down the
24 river we saw where wolves had killed three (3) moose in
25 one -- one spot and the next morning there was nothing,

1 nothing left of those moose.

2 So that's why I'm saying, is there, you
3 think an explosive number of wolves?

4

5 (BRIEF PAUSE)

6

7 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR.

8 That's a question we get all the time, if we're going to
9 do counts. It's -- it's not easy to do them and that's
10 one of the reasons why we haven't been doing them.

11 Now around here with the fires you had ten
12 (10) years ago, there's lots of moose and then there's
13 lots of food now for those wolves. So they are -- we
14 assume they are going up in number.

15 And in the -- in the North Slave region,
16 what we've been doing there is just -- is looking at --
17 we know where there's a lot of denning -- den sites for
18 wolves. And so we've been going to those every year to
19 see how many are used and how many puppies are making it
20 through the summer. And what we're finding there --
21 these are dens that are all right at tree line. They're
22 not down in the trees.

23 And those wolves there's less -- less dens
24 being used now and the -- the -- the adults at the dens
25 are not raising as many puppies because they're not

1 finding as much food out there.

2 So -- but that doesn't tell you what's
3 going on with the wolves that are living around here.
4 And at this point we don't have any plans to count them.

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan. Just
6 one more question and then we'll have to eat, okay?

7 MR. JIM TOBAC: Okay. My final question
8 I guess is on everybody's mind is what would the quota
9 be? I know Good Hope, if you look at their harvest their
10 study shows that Good Hope has killed more caribou than
11 Colville Lake over the years.

12 Yet Good Hope was not involved in these
13 studies and I know the -- looking at it and talking with
14 some of the hunters that, you know, we could leave most
15 of our quota to Colville Lake since that's their way of
16 life, that's their way of life in the caribou and we
17 have moose and stuff so. Thank you.

18

19 (BRIEF PAUSE)

20

21 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: Alasdair Veitch
22 with ENR. Yeah, regarding the -- the number of caribou
23 that would be the total allowable harvest for Bluenose-
24 West caribou, if we use the recommendation that came from
25 the Anuvialuit Wildlife Management Advisory Council which

1 was 4 percent of the 2006 harvest estimate then the --
2 and using the allocation formula for how to allocate the
3 harvest among the Anuvialuit, Gwich'In and Sahtu people
4 such that Sahtu gets 48 percent of the total then the
5 annual harvest for Sahtu communities so Colville Lake,
6 Fort Good Hope and Norman Wells would be, I believe,
7 three hundred and forty-seven (347) caribou per year.

8 Now how that gets allocated among
9 Colville, Fort Good Hope and Norman Wells, I guess the
10 RRCs and RRB and work that out. But that would be -- the
11 number would be three hundred and forty-seven (347) until
12 we do the next photo census in 2009.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks Alasdair, and I
14 think -- we have lunch here so we -- we might as well
15 take a break and come back maybe quarter after 1:00.

16

17 --- Upon recessing at 12:15 p.m.

18 --- Upon resuming at 1:25 p.m.

19

20 PUBLIC PRESENTATIONS:

21 THE CHAIRPERSON: I see everybody is back
22 in their seats here. We're going to have the -- you
23 know, today I mentioned at the beginning of the day that
24 there will be times when the general public would make
25 their presentations. So I think we will start off this

1 afternoon with that.

2 We have a number of people here and we can
3 start off with Charlie Barnaby if, yeah, these are on --
4 yes, I think Charlie is here.

5 The other thing, while Charlie is going to
6 sit down, we can, remember I said we want to record
7 everything to make sure everything is on record that the
8 Board is going to, you know, consider as evidence for
9 their decision, that means if we are going to do that
10 then you have to come up to one of the mics because they
11 cannot record if you do not do that.

12 Jody just tells me, maybe get both of you
13 up here, Charlie and Barthy. Is Barthy here too? Where
14 is Barthy? Barthy Cotchilly...? Maybe you can come up
15 here because we have you here as first, but I also have
16 Charlie as well here. You guys can decide who starts
17 first.

18 MR. BARTHY COTCHILLY: Well, I'm here
19 first.

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

21 MS. JODY SNORTLAND: Barthy came first so
22 he --

23 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, whoever wants to
24 start, I guess, we can -- if the translators are ready we
25 can get going here.

1

2 (NORTH SLAVEY TRANSLATED INTO ENGLISH)

3

4 ELDER CHARLIE BARNABY: Mr. Chair, I'd
5 like to -- right now our Chief is gone and submission-
6 Chief is gone and the president for -- that the other --
7 the Renewable Resource Council are gone too, so.

8 It's always nice to welcome people and I
9 understand people was talking this morning, but I didn't
10 welcome you, so, on behalf of Council, Chief and Council,
11 I welcome all of you and the -- for the people of Fort
12 Good Hope. It's always nice to be nice to one another,
13 we got to remember that we're Native people and we got
14 ways of respecting one another.

15 Well, I wanted to -- I built up a cabin in
16 Island Lake, 1972, when my kids were still small and I
17 stayed there from '72 'til 1980, that's when I left
18 there, but we -- they were old enough to go to school so,
19 I go there every year, like, I just came back from there
20 the other day.

21 But when we built that cabin in 1972, the
22 caribou came in on October 23rd, that Lake was just full,
23 when Benny Rutze (phonetic) were staying there. And ever
24 since I -- every year I go there ever since, you know,
25 even animal, when you're in the bush all the time, you'll

1 see that little change you'll notice right away. With
2 the land and the fish lakes and everything that's...even
3 beaver lodges or beaver lake, wherever you go you -- if
4 you are -- been raised in the bushes, you know, a little
5 change you'll notice right away.

6 So we, you know, us Native people we study
7 our land every day as we go along. I'm seventy-six (76)
8 years old and, like, I know what I'm talking about and I
9 went through lots, I went through lots of good time, lots
10 of bad times, hard times in the bush, you know, but it
11 was a good life.

12 'Cause that's, you know, the caribou are
13 really important to the -- us people, with generation
14 after generation. You know that sometime I hear people
15 talk, you know, from when I heard the Elders when I was
16 young was way different for me. They're talking about
17 self government so you can be boss of yourself and look
18 after everything.

19 You know, native people were self
20 government before white people. Before white people they
21 were self government, they look after everything:
22 Wildlife, fish, fur animals, their land, with respect for
23 the land. They don't try to kill everything in one part
24 of the country that -- on the land there. They -- they
25 know it's getting less, they go to the other part. They

1 don't stay in one place for years and years 'til they
2 kill everything. Even the fish Lakes too, they keep
3 moving, they're like animals the native people.

4 So we know the changes. I don't know what
5 can we do, but I know this much after getting plenty in
6 this land here, you go up the Hirskin (phonetic) in the
7 summertime, that's all you see. I never seen that, you
8 know, on those, you know, just lasted maybe about eighty
9 (80) years since started.

10 For all those things that they'll, you
11 know, maybe you've got to do something with the caribou.
12 And there's lots of plain land pretty -- when I say and
13 then Island Lake, oh yes, they stay in next Lake to me,
14 Barth, we stayed that 185 -- 172 or something, but an
15 aerial on a back fly really low, back and forth all day.
16 That was two (2) years ago.

17 You know it -- that animals are not -- are
18 pretty touchy animals, you know, they move away from
19 stuff, like, Mark and Jenny (phonetic), not only forest
20 fire chased them away, and helicopters all over the
21 place, prospectors.

22 So, I don't know, just some other people
23 had some ideas too but that really bothers me, you know,
24 so that something's got to be done. But remember that,
25 we -- we look after the -- our wildlifes as best as we

1 could, you know, we don't try to kill just for the fun of
2 it, we make a good use out of it. Thank you.

3

4 (TRANSLATION CONCLUDED)

5

6 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Charlie.

7 Barthy...?

8

9 (NORTH SLAVEY TRANSLATED INTO ENGLISH)

10

11 ELDER BARTHY COTCHILLY: My language.

12 There is something that really concerns me is this
13 caribou, what we are discussing now. They are talking
14 about this caribou collaring. This really disturbs me.

15 In the last, how many years, we have been
16 saying that we don't want this but it -- it seems like
17 these people that work in these positions don't listen to
18 us.

19 Caribou are like people. They are talking
20 about all of the different caribou earlier. It's just
21 like people, there might be -- maybe one (1) caribou that
22 has this collar on that they are keeping track of. It's
23 the same thing for us as people, when we -- our people
24 are off on the land like that we wonder how they're
25 doing; it's the same thing with the caribou too.

1 There's -- every -- every year when they
2 do this caribou count, I wonder how they -- they counted
3 it all. And they -- they keep track of it, take pictures
4 from the land and that from the air.

5 And in the last couple of years, there's
6 been too much planes and things flying around. I think
7 that's why we -- the -- the caribou haven't been coming
8 around that much. So when they start doing this caribou
9 count, I think that's when, like, the caribou go off in
10 different directions on the land.

11 Now, the -- the caribou are hardly around
12 Deline and it's the same around Colville Lake too. This
13 is wildlife that we sustain ourselves and live off.
14 These -- this is something that I'm concerned about,
15 that's why I'm talking about it.

16 Why is it that you are the only ones that
17 are doing work in this kind of field? Why isn't it so
18 that somebody, residents from the community can be
19 trained along with you so that they can continue to do
20 this work?

21 As well, they should have somebody that,
22 whenever they come, they should have people that travel
23 with them that -- that know about the same things, like,
24 have that traditional knowledge, so that when they speak
25 to people in the communities, they'll be able to have

1 somebody that can speak on their behalf.

2 Maybe they're hunting the caribou because
3 of the money. They are not people that -- people make
4 money from our land from exploration. If they want to
5 continue counting our caribou they -- how much money they
6 are going to be spending towards the study, they should
7 be giving about half of that -- that money to these true
8 communities to Fort Good Hope and Colville Lake.

9 And since they are going to be doing the
10 studies on our land and they're making money from doing
11 these studies too, and we are not getting any benefits
12 out of it. It -- and all of us that live here in these
13 two (2) communities, it seems like we never have enough
14 to harvest. And, as well, in Colville Lake if you wanted
15 to go hunting down that way, it's very expensive for gas
16 now too.

17 In these areas it seems like it's not
18 thought about, like, the hardships that we are going
19 through. And -- and this is something that I've been
20 thinking about, that's why I wanted to say this now.
21 Thank you.

22

23 (TRANSLATION CONCLUDED)

24

25 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi. On our list

1 here we have also...Jim asked me also to speak on the
2 general public for their...Jim, you wanted to...?

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Jim Pierrot, ka. Okay.

4

5 (BRIEF PAUSE)

6

7 THE CHAIRPERSON: Ka, ka, okay.

8 ELDER JIM PIERROT: I'm not going to ask
9 questions but I'll tell you a story about my own people
10 that want to know, how did -- they flying for caribou.
11 1982, that time there were -- the Band Council were each
12 -- were self government for the money, they give it to
13 the Chief and that's the way we fly around.

14 So 1982, I start -- we flying around for
15 caribou. What we do is part of March, we know that the
16 caribou is coming in November, but what they're doing
17 down this way towards Mackenzie River. So in part of
18 March and April that's the time we -- we fly around for
19 caribou. And when we do is from here we go to Anderson
20 River 5 miles down and then we see Mackenzie River that's
21 where we -- we -- they counted, you know, not too far
22 maybe a mile, maybe 2 miles, that's all. And then after
23 they count the Caribou, eh. We do that until Inuvik.

24 And a long time ago, I'm eighty-four (84)
25 years old and I live my life all -- all this time long

1 and they cut my cancer about four (4) years ago, since
2 that day in town. I live in the land all my life. I was
3 a councillor for sixteen (16) years, I can't be Chief
4 because I live on the land all the time. We stay out on
5 the land so I can't be Chief so I go on through all the
6 Chief, sixteen (16) years, that's a long time.

7 And exactly what we do for caribou that's
8 the way we do. In the old days in the past they were
9 named. There is, I don't know about white name -- white
10 man's name, but there is Shiyeline Caribou, Tsoga
11 Caribou, Aubry Lake, that's the same one, then come
12 around Colville Lake and (Native tongue spoken) Caribou,
13 wait a couple years, and Kochon cabin and James Bay
14 Caribou.

15 You goes around you, oh, the Bear Lake and
16 that's the one that I -- how many years ago he came
17 across here. But the people they supper him there, they
18 -- they left everything, the backbone and everything.

19 And then at that time the -- the Elder
20 they say is not going to come maybe twenty (20) years.
21 That was over maybe -- it's over twenty (20) years now,
22 never come back because they hurt him, huh.

23 So this is the way we -- we did for -- for
24 caribou. And we want where they eat, where they eat,
25 where is open places, that's where their food is, most of

1 their food is there. That's what they do.

2 Now Barbiell Kochon (phonetic) told me
3 that is not far from his cabin. There were open places,
4 big just like a lake, that's where the Caribou used to go
5 there. It's not far for him to hunt there and get
6 caribou, eh. But the bulldozer he -- this oil company
7 destroy that. No more. They send the caribou keep
8 moving there, they don't stop there anymore, because they
9 destroy the food there.

10 And this is oil company they are supposed
11 to have camp, they had to break up the bush where they --
12 they couldn't make -- they couldn't make camp there but
13 mud in open places, open places mostly caribou food isn't
14 there.

15 And then this a full two (2) years we fly
16 around and I've been in a bush all my life, my father
17 they used to go to Anderson River way back, they call
18 them Shiyeline and then I was with them with -- we
19 travelled -- we travelled by snowshoes and everything.

20 So what -- what -- why did -- I was flying
21 around with -- I tell last story to the young people, how
22 did the caribou they work out, eh. So maybe that's what
23 the -- you guys want to know about that.

24 So, is it right that the people that talk
25 about, you take somebody from here but he fly around with

1 him and then they -- you tell these people how the
2 caribou are working, how did they -- they do. But you
3 are a long way, just tell us and maybe you don't know the
4 country as we know the country. We know where the
5 caribou are moving.

6 Now today we got some noise and we look at
7 the map what the -- the caribou last year what he did,
8 this Colville Lake Caribou all move back into Tsoga
9 Caribou, caribou land. Tsoga caribou land there was a
10 bunch here -- nothing this way because of noise, they
11 don't like noise. That's the way he did.

12 So you're wondering why, how do we fly
13 around but that's the way we did. We -- we flied from
14 here and 5 miles down, we sit at Mackenzie River 5 miles
15 down until Inuvik, that's where we go. We didn't mind
16 about Campbell Lake caribou because Campbell Lake caribou
17 belong to Eskimo.

18 But Shiyeline Caribou this -- this way,
19 that is the way, that's the only one that we watch. And
20 the old people we know that all -- all my life I live off
21 the land, I listen to the old people, my grandfather.
22 Their country is down thataway. That's why my
23 grandfather just taught me Eskimo too, huh.

24 So the wolf we can't blame the wolf.
25 Maybe too much now the world is changing. But the wolf

1 is just like a doctor for caribou. If the wolf it
2 doesn't bother caribou then he will die off. They kill
3 only the one that are sick, they'd known that they're
4 sick so they kill them; that's the -- that's the way the
5 wolf are doing. They know that.

6 We learn, we live off of that land all my
7 life and I know how the caribou they're working. And you
8 should listen to people. You should take one (1) or two
9 (2) guys like that and fly around with them. And the
10 same thing with Colville Lake, Colville Lake is really,
11 we live by caribou. 1942 there was no caribou this side,
12 no. Not long after that they start to come here, about
13 1956, some time around there.

14 Before but they Good Hope they used to go
15 to mountain for caribou. There was no caribou down this
16 -- thataway. And they know that there's five -- five (5)
17 ways of caribou going this way all the time.

18 So I try to explain to young people, if
19 Colville Lake caribou they go to the next bunch, they
20 have to go back. That's the way they do. One time I'll
21 tell you, we're at Charlie Lake and I can't believe
22 caribou there was -- Charlie Lake is big, just full of
23 caribou there.

24 And then Shiyeline caribou they're all
25 mixed up. And on April, around there, we fly around.

1 They're going home, eh. We see that, can't believe
2 they're all going home and these caribou they're going
3 towards Colville Lake. You see that? They don't go to
4 each other, no, they know their own country. That's the
5 way they were.

6 So I can't talk too long, that's the way
7 they want to know. So is better to use your own people
8 like Norman and all the places of -- they check for
9 caribou and then they could go take people from where
10 they live on the land. We fly around for a moose towards
11 Sunsoo Rapids (phonetic). The same thing with caribou,
12 huh.

13 Me and Warren, Warren, we fly around
14 there. Warren he knows about that. You should ask Warren
15 about moose and caribou too. He knows how it works
16 there. So that's all I want to let you know about how
17 we've been flying for caribou, eh. 1982-'83 on part of
18 March and April when going back, with April and go back.
19 That's the -- that time we fly again.

20 So that sort of -- 'cause I just let them
21 know. Mahsi.

22

23 CONTINUED QUESTION PERIOD FOR ENR:

24 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Jim. I don't
25 think we have any more public presentations anymore, so

1 we can go back to the questioning where you have -- we
2 have -- yeah, let's, you know, I do not want to stop the
3 Elders from talking so but I've got a -- we have agenda,
4 they have -- you will have a time where you can -- you
5 make your presentations.

6 This is just for today. We have still
7 got, remember, we still have got two (2) days. And I do
8 not -- and I mentioned that to Joseph, I do not want to
9 rush things for the Elders today. You know, we will give
10 them the time to do their -- they can do their own proper
11 presentations when we get to their agenda.

12 Otherwise today, if we get you on there, I
13 am going to have to rush you, and I do not want to do
14 that. So we will stop with the general public
15 presentations and we will go back to the questioning.
16 You know, we have not heard anything from the RRCs yet,
17 okay.

18 I have a number of RRCs here. I do not
19 know if Roger is back or any of his -- they want to do
20 some questioning. Remember what I said, this is question
21 time for ENR presentation.

22 So I see Michel here, and I do not know
23 any of the RRCs want to question?

24 Well, we got -- okay. Harry, if you want
25 to do that. Remember, Harry, while you are doing that,

1 this is a question time for ENR. It is not a time for
2 you guys to make your presentation. You can do that
3 another time. No, no presentation.

4 ENR questions, ENR questions. Okay and
5 Jody informs me that Roger will be here tomorrow, so he
6 can do his presentation then. But if you have questions
7 for ENR, this is the time to do it.

8 Michel, you got a question? Okay, go
9 ahead, Michel, you can come up the mic there.

10 ELDER MICHEL LAFFERTY: Hello, I'm Michel
11 Lafferty. I sit on the board of directors for the
12 Renewable Resource Council. My thought is on the muskox.
13 I've been after -- talking about that for -- every now
14 and then. Like, does ENR know how many muskox is
15 wandering around our district from Colville Lake between
16 here and Normal Wells, Bear Lake?

17 If I remember correctly, they did one (1)
18 study on the north shore of Great Bear Lake. That's my
19 question, I guess. That's it.

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Michel. Go
21 ahead, Alasdair.

22 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: It's Alasdair
23 Veitch, ENR. To answer the question, Michel, we did a
24 survey, as you mentioned, mainly focussed north,
25 northwest of Great Bear Lake in March of 1997 and got an

1 updated population estimate for most of the Sahtu.

2 After that, from 19 -- I believe it was 19
3 -- I would have to check on my years, but there were four
4 (4) years in a row where we took a proposal to do an
5 updated survey to the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board for
6 consideration for support and funding, and the Board in
7 their deliberations decided that there were other higher
8 priority areas for funding and we had not done another
9 survey since that 1997 survey. So, we don't have an
10 updated population estimate from 1997 except from what we
11 call anecdotal or people's observations. We're hearing
12 about there being more muskox and they're expanding their
13 range to the point now where they're around Normal Wells
14 and down as far as the Bear River.

15 To address some questions about muskox in
16 the Sahtu, this year we presented a different kind of
17 proposal to the Sahtu Renewable Resources Board in
18 February at their meeting and it's to do a study on what
19 we call muskox ecology or basically finding out how the
20 muskox that are in the Mackenzie Valley live.

21 And Boyan is the lead on that project and
22 I'll pass it over to him and he can give a brief update
23 on what it is we're doing with muskox right now in the
24 Sahtu.

25

1 (BRIEF PAUSE)

2

3 MR. BOYAN TRACZ: Boyan Tracz, ENR. As
4 Alasdair mentioned ENR hasn't done the counts since '97
5 but in the last year we presented to the SRB a proposal
6 to take a look at, how he was saying, muskox ecology in
7 the -- in the Sahtu.

8 It's a small project, we just started it
9 this year and it was presented at -- at two (2) Resource
10 Board meetings where there were representatives from each
11 of the Renewable Resource councils and in February we
12 received funding from the Renewable Resource Board and
13 agreements from Renewable Resource councils to -- to
14 start the project.

15 And basically what it is is that we're --
16 we're putting out a couple of collars on the muskox, only
17 six (6); five (5) on cows and one (1) on a bull, and we
18 were planning on doing that in November, this November.

19 As of now we've only put out three, one
20 (1) about 20 miles south of Good Hope, one near Kelley
21 (phonetic) and Tertian (phonetic) Lakes and then one (1)
22 is down by Mahoney (phonetic). We're still planning on
23 putting out two (2) more on cows just beside Norman Wells
24 on the Franklin Range and then hopefully putting one (1)
25 on a bull down by Deline by the Bear River.

1 And we've been in -- in talks with Bruce
2 Kenny for him to help us locate a -- a bull in that area
3 because he knows the area and he's recently taken a bull
4 muskox down there as well.

5 It's a very basic project, basically,
6 looking at where they move, how long they stay in
7 different areas, where they are in different areas at
8 different times of the year, in the spring, summer,
9 winter, and also giving us the chance to see how many
10 calves they produce and how many of those calves survive;
11 kind of like we do with the -- the Boreal Woodland
12 caribou.

13 So it's a very preliminary project but it
14 might help to answer some of the questions about where
15 muskox are, how long they stay there, where they move to,
16 these sorts of things we're hoping to get at least more
17 answers for so we can pass on to the people who -- who
18 have asked questions about muskox in the Sahtu.

19 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Alasdair and
20 Boyan.

21 You know, we are still on the question
22 period for ENR's presentation. I am just going to go one
23 more and then we are going to continue with the list that
24 we have. We have our own people, as well as our legal
25 counsel and then Board members.

1 Now if we do not have any more questions
2 for ENR, I am going to continue with that if John is okay
3 with that.

4 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Mm-hm.

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: We have a question,
6 David? You'll have to come up to the --

7 MR. DAVID CODZI: There was just one (1)
8 slide there with a number 1998 and going to 2006. And on
9 there it's -- the harvesting is going down, you know,
10 just as you got all these numbers in that the caribou and
11 that are going down. Hunters are taking less. The way
12 that thing is going, it's going -- you don't really need
13 a quota. People are already starting to do stuff like
14 that, not being told and you just do it.

15 And that's what it looks like to me, you
16 know. Why do we need a quota when it's -- people are
17 already starting to do it? So that's one (1) of the
18 things I've got.

19 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, David. That's
20 a good question.

21 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. The
22 -- the decision about whether there's a quota or not is
23 -- is what we're talking about today for the -- so that
24 the Board can hear different views on it and it's not a
25 decision that -- that we'll make as a government. It's

1 something that the Board will recommend or not recommend.

2 So the kinds of comments you're making are
3 the kinds of comments that are helpful to hear for
4 everyone.

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Susan. Okay.

6 Lawrence was ahead of you there -- Richard -- Lawrence
7 then Richard.

8 MR. LAWRENCE MANUEL: Oh, I just wanted
9 to ask a question. I guess over the years you guys have
10 been studying the caribou and I was -- I just finished
11 asking one (1) of my friends about every spring when they
12 have a -- where they go for their calving, where they
13 have their young ones, I don't -- ever heard of you guys
14 or whoever do the count on the caribou; maybe they have
15 it in Tuk or Paulatuk wherever.

16 Why is that you don't bring the people to
17 see how many caribou is there because for myself I've
18 been -- I hunt a lot and when you guys say there's
19 getting less caribou, I don't -- I don't believe it
20 because I hunt every year from fall to March, April. I
21 go to Cold Lake and I -- I go hunting there but the
22 question I'm asking if you guys go to where they have
23 their young ones, why don't you bring some people to see?
24 We want to see how many caribous there. That's my
25 question.

1 THE CHAIRPERSON: Go ahead.

2

3 (BRIEF PAUSE)

4

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, go ahead.

6 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR.

7 Marsha is -- was saying that this summer in -- in June
8 when we went -- well, staff, different staff in different
9 regions went to all the different calving grounds. In
10 the Inuvik region the calving area was up in Tuktu
11 Nogait and on -- on the Cape Bathurst peninsula and so
12 they -- they took people with them there.

13 And for the Bluenose-East they were over
14 by Kugluktuk and there were people from there who went
15 there and in the Bathurst area, the dark-green area,
16 where they calve up on Bathurst Inlet people took people
17 from the Tlicho community. So, we are -- the plan is to
18 do something similar next -- next summer and we'll make
19 sure that we'll take some people from Sahtu for next
20 summer to see where those caribou calve.

21 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

22 Richard...?

23 CHIEF RICHARD KOCHON: My name is
24 Richard. I'm the Chief and also the president of RRC
25 Colville Lake. I've got about two (2) questions where on

1 the 19th, 17 day they -- they said you're not allowed to
2 shoot any more muskox. The Government put it like that.

3 What if -- what if we shot more than that,
4 the tags they gave us? We're going to get charged for
5 that? So that's my question and the other one, the one
6 that calving ground, there, too, I really -- I really
7 think about that one. I talk about it, too.

8 You know, last -- last fall when they had
9 that national assembly over here in Good Hope all the
10 chiefs came here and they put five (5) -- five (5) chiefs
11 on the -- on the caribou -- caribou committee -- caribou
12 summit or -- so on the Dene nation there's five (5) of us
13 on there: one (1) from each region.

14 So that calving ground, too, like we want
15 to know how much -- how much caribou that they -- they're
16 born in the springtime, eh? So it would be good -- be
17 good to have some of our young people work with maybe the
18 biologist to look at that -- us, we're never -- us,
19 we're way up here. We don't know.

20 It's good to know those -- those kinds of
21 things, eh, you know, like caribou, sometimes they go
22 near people and then less -- less animals bother it, eh,
23 like wolves, like, they bother it too much. One (1) time
24 there was caribou right close to Colville lake, eh, and
25 then the wolves, they hardly bother it, eh?

1 So if we put a -- put a quota on caribou
2 then, like, sometimes we -- just like a good hunter they
3 shoot five (5) caribou like that, eh, and you have to
4 share it to the community and it was a little piece.
5 Even two (2) moose like that, you share it with other
6 people. You've got -- you've got the whole community.
7 They all want a piece of meat. So that's the kind of
8 thing we've got to think about, eh? Muskox you -- right
9 now around Colville allover on the land you see muskox
10 all over.

11 Just like the -- the -- those days they
12 said you're not allowed to shoot caribou and just like
13 you can't open a back up now. It's like it's really hard
14 to open it back up and we should think about that kind of
15 -- maybe we open it up but then maybe it will be less
16 pressure on the caribou.

17 Sometimes we, in the past, we -- we never
18 have caribou all summer, eh? Sometimes we shoot one (1)
19 moose one (1) summer and then share with everybody, eh?
20 So I just had that question that if we -- we shoot more
21 than that tag that we're given and then we're -- we're
22 going to get charged for that, eh?

23 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay. Richard, we'll
24 answer those questions here. You've got two (2)
25 questions here, so, we'll start off with the -- if people

1 take more than what the tags allow for muskox will they
2 be charged will be the first question.

3 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. I
4 guess one of us here are officers so hard for us to
5 answer your question but I know that officers have
6 discretion when they look at situations so right now we
7 don't have that situation.

8 So I -- I don't have an answer for you.

9 CHIEF RICHARD KOCHON: Okay.

10 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Your question about
11 calving grounds and people going there. Last year some -
12 - last summer National Chief Bill Erasmus went up to the
13 calving ground in the Bathurst area to see it, so, I know
14 the Dene nation is having a meeting in early December,
15 they're going to have a caribou workshop and the chiefs
16 will all go there, so, I expect that's something people
17 will talk about there and we can work with people at that
18 meeting.

19 And I'll let Alasdair talk.

20 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: Yeah, just to add
21 to that, Chief Kochon, we have had several summer
22 students; sometimes we hire them ourselves, ENR;
23 sometimes we work with the SRB and we jointly hire a
24 summer student.

25 We've had two (2) summer students; one (1)

1 was Sean Tutcho from Deline and we also had Joel Doctor
2 from Norman Wells as summer students and we worked with
3 Parks Canada at Tuktut Nogait National Park which is the
4 calving grounds of the Bluenose-West herd. And both Sean
5 and Joel went up to Tuktut Nogait National Park and spent
6 two (2) to three (3) weeks working with park wardens and
7 biologists at Tuktut Nogait hands on, seeing what the
8 biologists do and seeing the country; that type of thing.

9 So we have done that work in the past and
10 we would be more than happy to do it again in the future
11 because the students really get a lot out of it and Parks
12 Canada do want to involve Sahtu students because Tuktut
13 Nogait National Park now does extend into the Sahtu. So
14 it's basically a win/win situation. So, yeah, we would
15 do it again.

16 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Alasdair. Just
17 a reminder. Richard also mentioned what he calls -- he
18 said five (5) chiefs on a caribou committee. I guess
19 he's referring to the Dene Nation. There's a committee
20 that the Dene Nation established because of all the
21 issues around caribou. And I think they're having a
22 workshop probably sometime in the first week of December.

23 But if people are wondering what Richard's
24 talking about, that's what he's referring to, the Dene
25 Nation Caribou Committee. They do have a committee

1 that's working some of the challenges that we're faced
2 with.

3 Now, I think we're going to get into the,
4 you know, the staff -- our staff -- our legal people and
5 certainly the Board Members, lastly, would be asking
6 questions and we'd like to start that but I don't know.
7 Once we do that, it's going to be long so if people want
8 a quick break before we get into our questions here? Are
9 you okay? Everybody's fine? You don't need any breaks?
10 Okay.

11 Well, let us start with our legal people
12 here then.

18 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.
19 Chairman. My name is John Donihee. I'm providing
20 counsel to the Board. I just have a couple of questions.
21 The first one is just to confirm something that was in
22 your written presentation -- or sorry, the speaking
23 notes, I think, but I didn't see in the rest of your
24 presentation.

25 I just want to confirm then that the --

1 the department has changed the wildlife regulations and
2 eliminated the harvest of nonresidents and residents of
3 caribou from the Bluenose-West Herd; is that -- is that
4 correct?

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: Go ahead.

6 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. The
7 regulations were changed for the Sahtu regio -- the Sahtu
8 management zones, all the Sahtu management zones, the
9 Gwich'in and the Inuvialuit, so, there's no resident or
10 nonresident hunting in those areas.

11 And commercial tags -- meat tags, as well,
12 there's none of those.

13 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: John Donihee again,
14 thank you. I'm wondering then if you could indicate one
15 (1) of the other things that's been talked about is
16 concern about disturbance and some of the development
17 activities that may be affecting caribou, noise, that
18 kind of thing.

19 Can you indicate whether it's your
20 understanding that ENR has any authority to protect
21 caribou from that kind of disturbance which might be
22 displacing them or affecting them at the population
23 level?

24

25 (BRIEF PAUSE)

1 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR.

2 Marsha was saying that in the Inuvialuit region if the
3 department makes comments to the Inuvial -- or the
4 Environmental Impact Screening Committee then -- and the
5 committee adopts those comments they can be
6 recommendations, too, that companies need to adhere to.

7 In the south of the Inuvialuit region
8 where the McKenzie Valley Resource Management Act is in
9 place, the department provides comments on reducing
10 disturbance from exploration or development activities to
11 land and water boards, and then it's up to land and water
12 boards to look at those and consider those.

13 And we don't have any authority ourselves.

14 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.

15 Chairman. John Donihee again. I'm just wondering if you
16 have any observations, you know, can you tell us what
17 your department's experience has been in working with the
18 Sahtu Land and Water Board in -- in respect of these
19 sorts of things.

20 You know, are you seeing terms and
21 conditions coming out in land use permits that address
22 wildlife disturbance concerns?

23

24 (BRIEF PAUSE)

25

1 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: It's Alasdair
2 Veitch, ENR. Yeah, what we do at the regional level, Mr.
3 Chair, is we collectively, myself and my staff and other
4 departmental employees, we all make comments on
5 development project binders when they come in.

6 We send them down to Yellowknife where
7 people with our environmental assessment section take all
8 the different comments that you get from various people,
9 and then we send a single letter to the Land and Water
10 Board as to our recommendations vis-a-vis wildlife. For
11 the most part those recommendations do show up in the
12 land-use permits and water licenses but it's -- would --
13 it wouldn't be correct to say it's a hundred (100)
14 percent but for the most part it is.

15 And also of course the Renewable
16 Resource's Board has their own environmental assessment
17 specialist who also sends in comments on behalf of the
18 SRRB, many of which pertain to wildlife as well.

19 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, sir. Mr.
20 Chairman, I have just a couple more questions.

21 One of the other things that I heard
22 mentioned this morning related to, you know, wolves,
23 predators and -- and predator control issues and I'm
24 wondering whether your department has implemented or --
25 any predator control measures in relation to the

1 Bluenose-West caribou herd to try to relieve the pressure
2 on the population?

3 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Marsha Branigan,
4 ENR in Inuvik.

5 I wouldn't say that we've initiated --
6 started any predator control measures. We have started
7 in the Inuvik region a wolf carcass collection where
8 we're collecting carcasses from harvested animals and we
9 pay a small fee to get the harvesters to bring that in
10 and we're going to use that to look at biological
11 information about the population.

12 And we have, as mentioned in our
13 presentation, collected information about the numbers of
14 predators seen during all the surveys that can be looked
15 at. But we are hearing from local information that there
16 are larger numbers of predators.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Marsha.

18 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.
19 Chairman, John Donihee again.

20 I might just observe that collecting them
21 after they're dead doesn't keep them from eating caribou.
22 I'm -- I'm -- so what I'm trying to get to is whether,
23 in fact, I mean has your department ever, you know,
24 encouraged, provided bounties or done some of the things
25 that might encourage hunters or trappers to go out and

1 actually harvest more wolves?

2 THE CHAIRPERSON: Go ahead.

3 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. In our, I
4 don't know how far to go back in what our department was
5 but I do know there were -- there was bounties provided
6 in the '50s and '60s and I think until the early '70s for
7 wolves that were harvested.

8 What -- right now we don't have a program
9 like that. We have looked at the Yukon and Alaska where
10 they have had control programs for wolves for mostly for
11 mountain woodland caribou herds but in Alaska also for a
12 barren-ground caribou herd.

13 In those cases it's my understanding it's
14 been for herds that have declined to very, very low
15 numbers and the -- when they -- before they did that
16 program they either stopped all hunting by people for
17 several years or greatly restricted hunting by people to
18 less than fifty (50), I think, caribou per year.

19 And the Yukon has a -- a policy in place
20 where they say that before they would enter or begin a
21 program they would require hunting by all people to stop
22 for two (2) years, I believe.

23 And that's all we've done is look at those
24 programs.

25 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

1 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.
2 Chairman, John Donihee.

3 You indicated that the Wildlife Management
4 Advisory Council under the Inuvialuit land claim had made
5 a recommendation to your Minister for a 4 percent quota
6 and I believe you said that the Gwich'in had agreed to a
7 similar percentage.

8 I guess what I'm wondering is, have -- has
9 your department actually taken regulatory action with
10 respect to those recommendations? So are they -- are
11 those quotas in legal force now or are -- is ENR just --
12 do you just have those recommendations in hand?

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, John. Go ahead
14 Susan.

15 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR.

16 Just to go back to the previous question,
17 John. Marsha did point out that in the Inuvialuit region
18 they did -- they did open sport hunting for -- by non-
19 residents for wolves. And the other -- we did -- I
20 forgot that we did make one (1) change for non-resident
21 hunters in the Sahtu and in the North Slave region where
22 we increased the number of tags a non-resident can have
23 for wolves from one (1) to two (2). But we have very few
24 hun -- wolves killed by non-residents.

25 For the other question, there's a number -

1 - a number of things have happened in different places so
2 I'll let Marsha begin with what's gone on in the
3 Inuvialuit and Gwich'in areas.

4 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Your question about
5 the 4 percent quota, for the Inuvialuit Region, they made
6 that recommendation to the Minister in October of 2006.

7 Since that time the HTCs have written by-
8 laws which changed the Caribou management zones to better
9 reflect the herds. And in the zone that reflects the
10 Bluenose-West -- the key range and the core range of the
11 Bluenose-West herd, they have implemented the requirement
12 for a tag to hunt in that area. So there is no actual
13 quota in regulation, it is the requirement for a tag and
14 then the tags have been issued.

15 The Game -- the WMAC decided how many tags
16 to be issued and the Game Council decided how to allocate
17 those tags to the communities and those tags have been
18 issued to the communities.

19 Further in the Inuvialuit region, the --
20 the adjacent herd, the Cape Bathurst herd, that herd has
21 been -- there's a quota -- there's no hunting of caribou
22 within that herd. So they have made management actions
23 that are now written into the HTC by-laws; those are
24 regulations that are in the Wildlife Act.

25 For the Gwich'in area, they sent a letter

1 to the Minister basically accepting the WMAC
2 recommendations but they also decided that they were not
3 going to harvest caribou in the -- from Bluenose-West or
4 Cape Bathurst area and they made changes -- changes have
5 been made to the Wildlife Act that shut down harvesting
6 for GHL and special GHL harvesters in GBC02.

7 MS. SUSAN FLECK: And for the -- in the
8 Sahtu area, there's been no action taken. The Board
9 asked that a recommendation be tabled and we have not
10 taken any further action.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks Marsha and
12 Susan.

13 Yes...?

14 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.
15 Chairman.

16 I just -- if I may, Marsha, come back to
17 the Bluenose Caribou harvesting -- Bluenose-West Caribou
18 harvesting in the ISR and the HTC by-laws.

19 You say they've gone to a tag system but
20 you haven't -- it's been effected through the regu -- the
21 by-law changes rather than other regulations. But I
22 guess I'm just wondering: How do you get to the 4
23 percent?

24 Are there only as many tags issued as
25 would represent 4 percent of their total harvest?

1 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: That is correct,
2 they -- the WMAC recommended the 4 percent and they used
3 4 percent of the 2006.

4 And they adopted the conversations that
5 had been had between the -- the Advisory Committee and
6 issued 48 percent of that and that was allocated to the
7 individual communities and tags were issued. So it has
8 been -- and that's how they're controlling that.

9 The -- each one (1) of those tags has been
10 put into a sample kit, so, we're collecting information
11 on every caribou that's harvested with a tag. And the
12 HTC is trying to keep track of the sex ratio of the
13 harvest.

14 So there was now a male and female tag
15 issued so that 80:20 percent ratio is being monitored by
16 the HTC.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Marsha.

18 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.
19 Chairman. I only have one (1) more question and then Ms.
20 Snortland has one.

21 I wanted to come back to that question
22 about muskox harvesting and -- and the -- going over the
23 quota. It seemed as though that wasn't really answered.
24 And you know that too.

25 It would seem to me that your officers do

1 have discretion as to whether or not to lay a charge in a
2 particular instance, but, it's fair to say, really, that
3 if there were a systematic over-harvesting over the quota
4 taking place in -- in obvious violation of the law that
5 the Department would have to deal with it.

6 Isn't that -- isn't that a fair statement?

7 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, go ahead, Susan.

8 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Yes, that's a fair
9 statement. Susan Fleck.

10 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.
11 Chairman. Those are my questions. I'll turn it over to
12 Jody.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, John. Jody,
14 you have questions?

15 MS. JODY SNORTLAND: I just have one (1)
16 question. Jody Snortland, with the Sahtu Renewable
17 Resources Board.

18 Based on earlier comments today, this
19 morning, how will ENR reduce the safety risk of flying
20 community members on surveys?

21 THE CHAIRPERSON: You got that? Okay.

22

23 (BRIEF PAUSE)

24

25 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. I --

1 I've talked to Alasdair and to Boyan about how we can
2 take people out on surveys and make it safe for people.
3 So I think it depends on the type of work that's being
4 done.

5 When it's -- when it's flying to count
6 caribou or to look for distribution, that's in a fixed-
7 wing aircraft and it's usually under controlled
8 situations. So as much as you consider flying in an
9 aircraft low risk, I would call that relatively low risk.

10 The situations that are high risk are
11 where you're in a helicopter and you're trying to net-gun
12 or dart an animal to handle it. We call that high risk
13 and we usually don't allow people to -- other people to
14 accompany those types of flights. But we could look at
15 having other people in a fixed-wing flying a lot higher
16 to observe what's going on and that would be a safer
17 situation to put them in.

18 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Susan.

19 Further questions, John?

20 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Mr. Chairman, with
21 your indulgence. I forgot to ask my wrap-up question. I
22 got excited by the fact that Jody had a question.

23 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay. Go ahead.

24 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: This is the last
25 question.

1 It seems to me, you know, from the
2 questions that I asked that the department has done what
3 it can do with respect to residents and non-residents;
4 you've eliminated all of that harvesting with respect to
5 the Bluenose-West Herd. And it seems, as well, that you
6 -- you're taking advantage of the avenues that are
7 available to you with respect to dealing with development
8 on the land.

9 I realize that you're not directly
10 responsible for managing or controlling land-use
11 activities. It also seems, at least at this point in
12 time, that you don't have any predator control programs
13 in place. And so, you know, you've carried through with
14 the recommendations from other users of the herd. I
15 guess we didn't explore what's happening in Nunavut but -
16 - but at least with respect -- you don't have any
17 authority in Nunavut anyways, so that's why I didn't ask
18 you about that.

19 So when I -- you know, I kind of tried to
20 be systematic and work through the options that are
21 available, short of actually affecting the harvest of --
22 of participants in the -- in the -- in the Sahtu land
23 claim.

24 The question I will ask and I'm -- I'm
25 quite -- it would be quite fine with me, actually, if you

1 want to take it under advisement and respond to the Board
2 to this question in your closing comments. So, you know,
3 if you want to answer it right now that's fine, if you
4 want to think about it and give your considered answer in
5 your closing comments, that would be fine.

6 But the question really is just, you know,
7 are there any other options short of reducing the harvest
8 of participants in the Sahtu land claim that the
9 department can offer to the Board as ways to manage this
10 problem with the Bluenose Caribou Herd?

11 Are there any other options out there that
12 you can identify from your experience, your knowledge of
13 the way these things -- history of the department, the
14 way these are managed elsewhere. What can you offer to
15 the Board that doesn't actually require cutting back
16 subsistence harvesting?

17 If there is anything, I ask you to bring
18 it forward. And if you think that there isn't anything
19 short of that answer, I'd -- short of cutting back
20 subsistence harvesting, I'd ask you to advise the Board
21 accordingly.

22 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, John.

23 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Thanks. Susan Fleck.

24 Thank you for the option of having the
25 opportunity to consider the question and we'll take

1 advantage of that opportunity and respond in closing
2 comments.

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

4 And the closing comments that Susan is
5 talking about would be at the end of the -- our hearings
6 here after two (2) or three (3) days, I guess.

7 Jody, do we have any more questions for
8 our staff?

9 MS. JODY SCOTLAND: No.

10 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Judy.

11 Now we are getting to the portion where,
12 you know, our Board's -- are usually the last ones. You
13 know, to make sure, you know, your questions -- if you
14 want your questions recorded then certainly -- to be
15 considered by the Board here, then you need to ask them.

16 Now our Board, I'm going to ask each of
17 our Board members if they have any questions on the
18 presentation. But while they are getting ready for that,
19 you know, I am going to add one (1) more piece of
20 information for our Board.

21 Remember I said the Boards are -- three
22 (3) of them or half of them are nominated by the First
23 Nations especially SSI, and the other half by government,
24 you know, GNWT, Federal.

25 And then once that happens they nominate

1 their own chairperson, and it is usually either one (1)
2 of their chairpersons or it could be anybody in Sahtu.

3 So at this time, I would start maybe --
4 unless one (1) of the Boards have a question right away
5 that they want to bring with. I am not going to make any
6 order of how you present your questions, you have the
7 floor now to ask your questions.

8 So any one (1) of you can start. Yes.

9 You had better used to that mic there.

10 MS. ROSA ETCHINELLE: Hi. My name is
11 Rosa Etchinelle, I'm an SRRB Board Member.

12 The question I have is if SRRB does
13 recommend that we set a quota, what -- what type of
14 monitoring does ENR have in place to monitor the people
15 out there that are, like, taking the caribou? Like, is -
16 - what enforcement will ENR will be doing?

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Rosa.

18 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR.

19 We've been hearing for a long time that
20 people want to see more wildlife officers out on the land
21 and when the -- the Minister released the Caribou
22 Management Strategy, there was an action in there to
23 increase patrols. So we did get some additional money
24 for patrols and the -- and then we've provided that money
25 to the regions that have needed extra -- especially for

1 the -- to make sure that people are following the laws
2 with respect to caribou.

10 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

11 Any follow-up on that, Rosa?

12 MS. ROSA ETCHINELLE: No, but I have
13 another question.

14 My other question is: With all this
15 climate change and there's a lot of forest fires and
16 within the last couple of years there's a -- a lot of
17 area burned within the Sahtu region. And like how long -
18 - like, can you tell me, like, how long does it take for
19 the caribou's food to come back in those areas that are
20 burned?

21 And are there winter and summer habitats
22 in those areas different for caribou? Like, can you tell
23 me, like, would they go back into those areas?

24 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Rosa. Go
25 ahead, Susan.

1 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck.

2 When there's forest fires in the forest --
3 well, I guess there's people here who can probably tell
4 you how long before caribou come back. The information
5 that we have, as biologists, is it takes about fifty (50)
6 or sixty (60) years for the lichen, the moss, to grow
7 back in areas.

8 But caribou also -- in the Yellowknife
9 area, we have barren-ground caribou and we had a big fire
10 go through there about ten (10) years ago and there's a
11 lot of grasses that have grown up and the -- and some of
12 the caribou have been going into those areas in the
13 wintertime to eat the grasses.

14 So I think it also depends on how much
15 land was burned at one (1) time and how many green areas
16 there are in between. So it's kind of hard to answer
17 that question.

18 And I think people here have the
19 experience to understand it.

20 The other thing is that in our department,
21 we also are responsible for managing the forests, and the
22 Director there, the policy they have, they're going to
23 start discussions in the next couple of years of looking
24 at forests -- fires and forests and how they should be
25 managed in relation to what people feel is important.

1 So it's something that should be discussed
2 with the Regional Forest Management people in managing
3 forests.

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Susan.

5 MS. ROSA ETCHINELLE: Okay, yeah, that was
6 just like basically, my question was going to forest
7 management. Like, there are so many fires burned, like,
8 is there anything like, something to do with forest --
9 forest management.

10 Like, is there going to be something in
11 place where they action fires, like some fires not all,
12 where the total area is burned?

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, go ahead, Susan.

14 MS. SUSAN FLECK: The -- I don't really
15 want to answer for the Forest Management people but the
16 Forest Management policy right now is -- is set up so
17 that it protects values at risk. And I know I've had
18 some discussions with the Director there, she's
19 interested in knowing if there's particular areas that
20 are in the -- in the forest that are really important for
21 winter habitat for Barren-ground Caribou and she would
22 like to know about those.

23 And I know that the regional staff have
24 been directed, I believe, this winter to go and talk to
25 communities about that question and it's something they

1 should be raising in those discussions so they could look
2 at protecting them.

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Susan. I guess
4 Rosa.

5 Any other Boards then? Okay, Paul, go
6 ahead.

7 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Thank you, Mr. Chair.

8 My name is Paul Latour, Board Member.

I have a few questions, some of them of a technical nature but the first one (1) sort of follows through from a question Colville Lake had about how does -- and the way I seem to recall it going was, how does ENR make sure that in their photo censusing they're getting all the caribou? Are there caribou out there that might be missed?

23 And it's essentially: Of the collared
24 caribou, how many do you in fact relocate and what is --
25 your photo census is based on how many collared caribou

1 are actually relocated?

2 You know, and we have -- we've done at
3 least photo censuses of the herd over in two (2)
4 consecutive years. I'm wondering in those surveys, what
5 proportion of the collared females were actually
6 relocated and used to identify the locations of the
7 caribou?

8 I didn't -- I didn't see the numbers in a
9 presentation and I think -- I mean, I've been around the
10 caribou story here a bit now, having sat on this Board,
11 and I think I have heard reference to certain -- certain
12 percentages of cows, and it's often high I thought.

13 But I'm wondering can -- can you tell me
14 exactly, or pretty closely, what the -- what the
15 relocation rate is on those cows, which would give a
16 pretty good indication. If you're getting a lot of those
17 radio-collared cows back, that kind of tells me you're
18 counting a lot of the caribou. So it's -- that's the
19 question.

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Paul. I would
21 like to remind, you know, our Board Members as well, the
22 translators, you always have to be cognizant of them.

23 Okay. Go ahead.

24 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: For the Bluenose-
25 West census in -- for Bluenose-West census, first thing

1 I'd like to point out is that the collars are put out on
2 cows and bulls; though there is a higher percentage on
3 the cows, there -- both sexes have collars on it during
4 the census period.

5 In 2005, we had sixty-three (63) marks
6 out, what we call "marks" out there or collared animals
7 that are available. Fifty-four (54) of them were located
8 the day -- the days that we did the actual photos.

9 In 2006, we located sixty-five (65) out of
10 sixty-six (66) and photographed them during that day.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yes, go ahead, Paul.

12 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Yeah, Paul Latour here
13 again. So especially for the 2006, I mean that kind of
14 tells me to actually locate sixty-five (65) out of sixty-
15 six (66) cows that are out there, I mean, that would
16 probably tell me that you're actually pretty much on top
17 of the caribou that are out there running around on the
18 countryside.

19 I mean, if there was more -- if there was
20 -- if you hadn't relocated, say, a number of the cows, it
21 would tell me that there's probably caribou out there
22 somewhere else, that you're not getting in your -- in
23 your pictures. But the fact that you'd almost got all of
24 them, especially in that one year, I mean, would tell me
25 that you're probably counting the bulk of the caribou,

1 right?

2 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: That is our
3 contention. That's what we believe. We are counting
4 them all.

5 The question too, though, there is -- and
6 we showed that slide that showed all the -- the flight
7 lines that were done during the census period and
8 basically we're trying to eliminate any collars that has
9 fallen off during the release or the animal has died.

10 So we're trying to find everything, the
11 collars that are out there that are no longer available
12 for the census and there are a few that we do not find
13 that we -- because we search so extensively, we're
14 considering that they're no longer functioning.

15 So those are the ones that we found during
16 all that searching and during the actual photo period we
17 -- that's how many we actually photographed.

18 THE CHAIRPERSON: Now, Marsha, I cannot
19 see those translators. You do not have any problems
20 translating?

21 Okay. Okay. Just wave at me or something
22 so I know if they are going too fast. Okay, Paul...?

23 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Yeah, Paul Latour here
24 again. I -- I had a question on a slide that was in
25 ENR's presentation that was posted on the public registry

1 but I noticed it didn't appear in the presentation this
2 morning and, in fact, in the old -- the old presentation
3 it was slide 20. I don't know if we can throw that up in
4 a hurry or...

5

6 (BRIEF PAUSE)

7

8 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Yeah, that's the one.

9 So if I can continue. This slide I believe you were
10 trying to show, it shows the number of caribou herds on
11 the right-hand side and it shows sort of trend lines for
12 all of those herds with the key message being over about
13 an eighty (80) year period these herds have kind of gone
14 from lows up to highs and then seem to be tailing off
15 again.

16 So there's a real long term cycle going on
17 there and I think you used the words, I saw, quotes,
18 unquotes, "part of a natural cycle". So herds are
19 increasing and decreasing in large part unrelated to
20 human activity at least direct human activity, hunting,
21 that kind of thing.

22 Can a conclusion be made therefore then,
23 you know, in the long term management of caribou in the
24 NWT especially. In reality we might be quite limited as
25 to what effect we can have on -- on trends on herd size.

1 I mean, if this is some -- is the implication here that
2 these -- these ingrained trends which this seems to be
3 showing are so -- so manifestly part of the species, is
4 there anything we can actually do to -- to, say, start
5 bringing them out of these low periods especially, any
6 quicker?

7 And I guess follow-up question to that
8 would be: In ENR's experience or their knowledge of
9 caribou management anywhere else in North America has
10 that ever been done for any other -- for any herds of
11 caribou where this kind of rise out of this -- out of
12 this trough here has been accelerated through -- through
13 management actions?

14 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, thanks, Paul.
15 Yeah.

16 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, ENR. It's
17 a -- it's about a thirty (30) year period that we're
18 looking at and what I was trying to say in response to an
19 earlier question is that the last time, well, last time
20 we went through this was in the -- in the late -- in the
21 '70s and at that time there -- things have changed a lot
22 since that time in how people behave and what we do.

23 So when we look at that time in the -- in
24 the late '70s there, people were still out trapping lots
25 at that time. The people we're just starting to use the

1 snow machines in the -- in the late '60s early '70s.
2 They're all small machines. They didn't go as far as the
3 ones we have now. There was oil and gas activity up in
4 the Mackenzie Delta, but there wasn't much going on
5 elsewhere. There was some gold mining staking going on.
6 There was no winter roads yet into lots of the area that
7 the Barren-Ground caribou winter in. And there wasn't a
8 lot of airplanes, not like what we have now flying
9 around.

10 So those kinds of things are different
11 now, and so we worry that with caribou numbers going down
12 and all those conditions have changed, plus, we have
13 different weather patterns happening now that what we do
14 for caribou now in any ways that we can reduce pressures
15 will be helpful to them, because they haven't experienced
16 all that in the past.

17 So that's why we think we can do something
18 about it now and help them, but we feel that -- well,
19 we've all -- this year we already saw that things were
20 better for -- there were more calves born. They're in
21 good shape this winter, and if we have a number of -- of
22 years like that where we have lots of calves being born,
23 they stay in good shape, the adults are in good shape
24 then the caribou numbers will go up again, but, if we
25 help them now they'll go up faster.

1 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks Susan. Well you
2 -- you have more questions, I guess, yeah.

3 MR. PAUL LATOUR: I can keep going if you
4 want.

5 THE CHAIRPERSON: Well, no, it's your
6 time now you can...

7 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Okay.

10 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Paul --

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: -- Latour so that --

12 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Yeah. Paul Latour
13 speaking, board member.

In your response to the information request number 1.1 ENR provided a list of options, management options, based apparently on -- on a limited number of what they call management options that could be employed to possibly reverse the -- the decline of the herd.

20 And it also said at the same -- later on
21 in that IR 1.1 that there's a wide variety of management
22 options, and I'm quoting here, including all the above
23 were suggested to assist the Bluenose-West herd to
24 recover, but they're not listed.

25 So I'm wondering, were there additional

1 management options out there that we didn't see in the
2 response. And I guess that's kind of the first part of
3 the question and the second part would be, it would be
4 really useful for this Board to have what ENR senses of a
5 prioritization of the -- of these management options.

6 What -- I mean even just the top three
7 (3). What has to be done in terms of these -- of these
8 management options that you -- you provided in the
9 response but weren't really discussed in any order of
10 importance that I could tell.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Paul. Yeah,
12 go ahead.

13 MS. SUSAN FLECK: I -- I guess it's a --
14 that question might be a bit similar to what John Donihee
15 asked us to think about.

16 The -- the other thing I want to mention
17 is that when, in -- in 2005 when we first got the results
18 we knew that we had -- that we were collecting the
19 information and -- and we had to go and present it to the
20 boards and to the communities.

21 We -- we didn't have a lot of options. We
22 didn't want to make a lot of suggestions for options. We
23 wanted to see and listen to what people had to say and
24 suggest. So we hadn't -- at that time, we didn't make a
25 list of management options. We didn't come up with any

1 priorities at all. We had some of our ideas, but mostly
2 we tried to be quiet and -- and listen to what people
3 were going to say and work it through the co-management
4 process to come up with a -- something that everyone
5 could agree with.

6 So in the Information Request what you see
7 there is kind of what was talked about, but it doesn't --
8 it doesn't list a prioritization as you suggested. And
9 it -- it's not an exhaustive list, because we didn't go
10 forward with an exhaustive list. So we'll look at the
11 question that you asked and -- and try and address it in
12 the closing comments.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

14 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Next question, yeah,
15 okay. Refers to the -- you referred to it in your
16 presentation ENR Strategy Caribou Forever. And in
17 there's what I thought was quite an -- an impressive
18 agenda for monitoring and research laid out by years,
19 dollars required, and that sort of thing.

20 And it appears that monitoring actions
21 were -- and significant dollars associated with that were
22 identified to begin in 2005, 2006. And by the same token
23 modelling was also identified as a strategy beginning in
24 2006 but, to date, and even in the IR response to 1.1, we
25 didn't really see a -- a direct response to the question

1 on modelling - which I'll get to a bit later - implying
2 that there were, you know, and it's imply -- implying
3 that there's insufficient data and it -- and it applied -
4 - and you seem to suggest that monitoring -- the data had
5 -- wasn't there because monitoring hadn't happened yet.

14 And I'm just wondering where you are in
15 it, and why at least maybe I'm reading -- not reading the
16 situation entirely accurately, but why things seem to be
17 dragging.

18 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Paul. Yep,
19 Susan.

20 MS. SUSAN FLECK: The -- the strategy
21 came out about eighteen (18) months ago, and we did -- we
22 did put in and -- a lot of monitoring actions, because we
23 know that we're not collecting a lot of information. How
24 -- we have made an effort to improve that and so we have
25 -- we've started a lot of stuff, so this past spring we

1 made everyone in the regions was -- tried to go out and
2 get calf survival information, but -- and this fall
3 everyone tried to go out to do a -- a count around the
4 rut to look at adult male and female sex ratio and also
5 how many calves made it through the summer.

6 Weather has stopped us from doing a number
7 of those surveys. So we are -- we're trying to do what
8 we can when weather doesn't stop us from doing it. The
9 expectation is that next spring, again, we'll -- everyone
10 will try and go out to collect the calf survival
11 information. We started now getting the condition
12 information from all regions, and we're trying to now
13 work on ensuring that everyone's using the same
14 measurements and techniques for collecting that
15 information so it's comparable.

16 We're in -- in a couple of regions they
17 have more funding so they're able to do a little bit more
18 work. So in the North Slave region, they're also able to
19 go out on the community hunts but here in -- in Sahtu
20 they went out on -- some people went out on the Horton
21 Lake hunt to collect more information on condition. And
22 we're working with people on the land as well.

23 The modelling is something that -- that we
24 -- is in the strategy and Anne Gunn was on contract to do
25 some more work on that for the Bathurst herd where we

1 have the best collection of information. Again, it -- we
2 agree it's something that we want to look at more. And
3 to do that we need some additional information on adult
4 survival and right now we've just been collecting or
5 obtaining that for adult females from the females that
6 are collared. And there's pros and cons to how good that
7 information is.

8 So Marsha did do some modelling for the
9 Cape Bathurst herd which is down to a very low number,
10 but for some of the data she looked -- she used
11 information from the Porcupine herd and applied it in
12 that model.

13 So, we're trying to do what we can and it
14 -- monies not the problem, we've gotten all the funding
15 for this strategy. And it's mostly trying to -- it's a
16 lot of work for everyone to do, so.

17

18 (BRIEF PAUSE)

19

20 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Just a couple more
21 things to -- to touch on. In the plan it mentions
22 starting to work on management plans; that's in the
23 works. We've got the funding, and we're just about to --
24 to make contacts. The wildlife management advisory
25 committee for the Bluenose has recommended that we start

1 that process and has asked ENR to -- to work towards it.

2 We're also working on a harvest calendar
3 so we can collect harvest data. So we're going to
4 develop a calendar that can be handed out to all the
5 harvesters and start trying to get better harvest data
6 again.

7 And we also -- I think -- you never
8 mentioned that we did a calving ground distribution
9 surveys across the NWT this year as well. Some surveys
10 were done on all the calving grounds looking at where the
11 animals are calving. And on some of the herds we
12 collected information on the number of calves being born
13 or the July, like, yeah, the calves per hundred (100)
14 cows or -- yeah, calves per hundred (100) cows. Yeah,
15 some of -- on some of the herds it's done in June and in
16 the Bluenose-West it was done in July.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Marsha and
18 Susan. The -- Paul, maybe this is what I said we -- we -
19 - these kind of questions really takes a big toll on our
20 translators. They're gonna need a break.

21 So I was gonna break at 2:30 -- or 3:30,
22 but maybe we should take a break now and start again
23 around 3:30. Yeah, a longer break so we can get a good
24 break here so that we can continue till about 5:00, I
25 guess.

1 --- Upon recessing at 3:10 p.m.

2 --- Upon resuming at 3:35 p.m.

3

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: Can -- can we get the
5 boards back to their seats. While -- while they're doing
6 that the -- we're still at a point where the Boards
7 themselves were questioning the ENR's presentation. And
8 while we're settling in our seats too, remember, you
9 know, we're going through a process here, a hearing
10 process.

11 We are -- the Elders keep asking me
12 they're going to -- they are going to get a chance to --
13 to speak. Remember, we've got three (3) days. And like
14 I said again, I'm going to repeat. I don't want to rush
15 things. I know how the Elders it's going to be towards
16 the end of the day.

17 So we'll -- we'll continue with our
18 questioning here. I think we were at Paul. Marsha was
19 just finished answering one (1) of the questions that
20 Paul Latour has.

21 So Paul, do you want to continue with
22 that?

23 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Yeah, I guess -- Paul
24 Latour here, board member. When I was asking I think the
25 previous question, I mentioned that -- try to get back to

1 the -- the modelling question.

2 And I'm wondering given that we didn't get
3 a model through the IR process, I'd just like to explore
4 this afternoon and hopefully not take too much time on
5 it, the possibilities of -- of pursuing this modelling
6 approach, given that we don't have perfect data for the
7 Bluenose herd, we do have some field base data. We have
8 data from caribou herds that are in proximity.

9 I mean, from a -- from the Board's
10 standpoint and -- and given the importance of the
11 decision we have to make around a total allowable
12 harvest, we've used, you know, any sorts of tools that
13 are out there as being valuable, especially something
14 along the lines of modelling where we can plug in various
15 population, parameters, to explore the, you know, the
16 effectiveness of a 3 percent harvest versus a 4 percent
17 or a 2 percent or a 0 percent for that matter.

18 I know there's an infinite combination of,
19 you know, of these population parameters, if you like,
20 but I mean a good modeller can kind of sit and look at
21 the stuff and say, well, okay I can, you know, narrow it
22 down to this and this and this and start coming up with
23 some very instructive scenarios, you know, based on --
24 based on those decisions.

25 So, I'm just wondering, the Board is still

1 very interested. I know time -- these -- these things
2 don't happen overnight. We're not looking at something
3 that happened in a matter of a week or two.

4 But I guess -- I guess the question at
5 this point would be: What, in ENR's view, would be a
6 reasonable time-frame to undertake such an exercise and
7 of what value do they see it being? I guess would be my
8 question at this point.

9 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Paul. And
10 again, Paul, I know I have to keep reminding - watch
11 those interpreters. You pushed them very fast and a lot
12 of the translations are not going to be as clear as they
13 should. Just slow down a little bit.

14 And the other thing at this time too, I'm
15 -- I'm going to mention that the Elders have rides, they
16 have rides in the morning here to -- to the hearing and
17 then at the end of the day as well. The driver I think
18 is Joe -- Joe Furlong, I'm sure most of you know him so.
19 Just to advise the Elders. Okay, go ahead.

20 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Marsha Branigan
21 here with ENR in Inuvik. I guess you asked two (2)
22 questions, a time-frame and what was the value we see in
23 this.

24 Time-frame I think we could do it within a
25 month. What I'm suggesting that we're going to do is,

1 they have -- we used it actually at the Porcupine Caribou
2 Harvest Management Workshop. They have what we -- Don
3 Russell calls the caribou calculator. And basically it's
4 got different options in there and you can put in
5 different options for different harvest rates and see
6 what it does.

7 But you're -- when you're doing that
8 you're assuming that all other things remain the same.
9 So we -- we have to pick an adult survival rate and then
10 we can adjust the harvest and see what happens.

11 And what they did at the Workshop was they
12 had an adult survival rate that was -- when the herd was
13 growing, when the herd was declining slightly and when
14 the herd was declining at a larger rate.

15 And then they modelled the different
16 things you can do with harvest, like reducing your
17 harvest or making it the only harvest or a certain
18 percent of those and see how -- what it did to the
19 population.

20 It's only a tool. It'll just give us an
21 idea of what -- what different harvest strategies will --
22 could possibly do to the recovery of the herd. But we
23 should be able to do that.

24 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Marsha.

25 MR. PAUL LATOUR: I'm probably free to --

1 to mention this but I think very recently there has been
2 a modelling exercise done with the -- the Bathurst herd.
3 I think those results will be out fairly soon. It's no
4 great secret anymore.

5 Would it be fair to expect an analysis
6 similar to what was done there?

7

8 (BRIEF PAUSE)

9

10 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, go ahead, Susan.

11 MS. SUSAN FLECK: It's Susan Fleck. My
12 understanding is that what -- what was done for the
13 Bathurst herd is a -- a different approach. And there
14 were -- there's a number of statistical analyses that go
15 along with it and it took a lot longer than a month to
16 do.

17 It's different from what was -- the
18 simplistic model that was used for the Porcupine herd.
19 So I don't think we could make a commitment to do
20 anything like that quickly.

21 We could make a commitment to find out
22 what the difference is between the approach taken there
23 and what was done at the Porcupine Workshop.

24 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

25 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Okay, I hear you there.

1 That would be good if we could at least commit to a month
2 on the -- on the approach that Ms. Branigan suggested.
3 Yay? Nay?

4 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Mr. Chairman, if we
5 may, we'll call that Undertaking number 1 to produce a
6 model -- simple model, I don't know what you want to call
7 it, of the Bluenose herd based on the -- the work that
8 was done on the Porcupine herd to be forwarded by ENR to
9 the Board in approximately a month.

10 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Yes, and Paul Latour
11 here. With -- with special emphasis and I think you --
12 you implied this, but on the -- on what we're here today
13 to talk about the -- the TAH number and, you know,
14 exploration around those -- those possibilities, 3
15 percent, 4 percent, 2 percent, I don't know. Who knows
16 what we'll decide.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay. That's
18 Undertaking Number 1 then. I don't know. We'll just
19 call it Undertaking Number 1 until you -- you agree to
20 exactly what the wording should be I guess.

21 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: It's John Donihee, Mr.
22 Chair. As long as ENR is clear on what they're being
23 asked to do and that's what Mr. Latour wants, that --
24 that's the way we should describe it.

25 I could leave it to -- maybe it's simpler

1 if we ask ENR to repeat what they understand they're
2 going to do and just make sure that Mr. Latour confirms
3 that's what he wants.

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, maybe that's what
5 we'll do then. Okay, Susan...?

6 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. Yes, my
7 understanding is that we'll use the -- the caribou
8 calculator model from the Porcupine Harvest Strategy
9 Workshop and input information in there to look at the
10 different harvest rates that are being discussed for the
11 Bluenose-West herd. And we'll do that within a month.

12 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan. You've
13 got that, Paul, you're happy with that?

14 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Yeah, I think -- yeah,
15 that's my understanding. Paul Latour here. That -- that
16 would be my understanding.

17

18 --- UNDERTAKING NO. 1: For ENR to use the caribou
19 calculator model from the
20 Porcupine Harvest Strategy
21 Workshop and input
22 information in there to look
23 at the different harvest
24 rates that are being
25 discussed for the Bluenose-

3

4 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, then Paul, you
5 going to continue with your questions, right?

6 MR. PAUL LATOUR: I don't want to hog the
7 mic here. I guess the other -- this is a pretty simple
8 one and I think I heard it being suggested earlier and it
9 was around the whole area of consultations with the
10 communities associated with the Bluenose-West herd.

11 And I -- I suspect, tell me if I'm wrong,
12 that you may have done this already. But I guess it
13 could be considered another undertaking in the sense that
14 we would like a chronology of the consultation events
15 associated with the Bluenose herd going back at least to
16 2005 when the decline was first detected and maybe even
17 before that, a couple of years.

18 Just a full documentation of the
19 consultation process that has occurred by community, what
20 the topic was and I suspect that's not hard for you to
21 do.

22 Would that be an undertaking then or --

25 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, Paul That'll be

1 Undertaking 2 then, that's just a chronology of all
2 activities to do with consultation.

3 I think here we -- we may have to be
4 careful that we don't use the term 'consultation'. Maybe
5 some information process with -- with -- with all the
6 communities that are -- that are going to be affected.

7 But I think what, you know, we have to
8 note that. We don't want to confuse that with, you know,
9 all these consultation terms that come out today.

10 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Mm-hm, yeah.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Can we -- we probably
12 can use another -- another term.

13 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: John Donihee, Mr.
14 Chairman. Perhaps we can just ask them to iden -- we can
15 call it community engagement or something like that to
16 avoid the other -- that other bad kind of consultation.

17 And -- and get the list -- really, it's
18 simply a list of contacts and involvement with the
19 communities about these issues.

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, John. Okay that
21 will be fine with you then, Paul? Yeah, go ahead.

22 MS. SUSAN FLECK: We can undertake to
23 provide a list of meetings that were done with
24 communities and we'll indicate, in most cases, -- well,
25 we'll give an indication of other agencies that were

1 involved because usually the Sahtu Board members were
2 involved in these meetings.

3 And we can do it, if you want, for the
4 entire Bluenose-West range, so, we have that information
5 for the Inuvialuit region as well. And our preference
6 would be to go back to September 2005 when we started
7 this process, if that's all right with the Board.

8 MR. PAUL LATOUR: I think, Mr. Chairman,
9 that's agreeable by me.

10 THE CHAIRPERSON: So let's note that
11 Undertaking 2. I'm going to have to make sure it's
12 there, maybe just refer it to John there who's -- you
13 know, we don't want to go back to the recordings to get
14 these things. We want those available for the Boards to
15 look at.

16 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Thank you, Mr.
17 Chairman. As I understand it then, a listing
18 chronologically of community engagement meetings between
19 ENR and other agencies in respect of the Bluenose caribou
20 -- Bluenose-West caribou herd from 2005 to the present,
21 including meetings that have been held with Gwich'in and
22 Inuvialuit as well.

23 I guess for the sake of convenience is it
24 acceptable to ENR to produce that at the same time as the
25 models; is a month enough time?

1 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, go ahead, Susan.
2 MS. SUSAN FLECK: We could actually do it
3 within a week. We already did a chronology before we
4 came here and we could put it into a -- a format that's a
5 little easier to read than what we've done.

8 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Mm-hm.

11 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Mr. Chairman, let's
12 just say no later than a month.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, no later than a
14 month then.

15

16 --- UNDERTAKING NO. 2: For ENR to provide a listing
17 chronologically of community
18 engagement meetings between
19 ENR and other agencies in
20 respect of the Bluenose-West
21 caribou herd from 2005 to the
22 present, including meetings
23 that have been held with
24 Gwich'in and Inuvialuit as
25 well and to provide it no

1 later than a month.

2

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, Paul, you still
4 have the floor here.

5

6 MR. PAUL LATOUR: I guess to get back to
7 the last of a technical sort of area that I wanted to
8 explore here was this whole -- and, you know, in your
9 response to IR-1.1 and, in the presentation, I think it
10 was slide 49, the terms -- a suggested harvest rate of 3
11 percent of the 2006 herd size is -- is provided.

12 And, then -- now, that was suggested at
13 some point, and then a bit later on, the Wildlife
14 Management Advisory Council and then, subsequently, the
15 GRB followed suit with a -- with a 4 percent suggested
16 harvest rate based on a -- presumably, the 2006 herd
17 size.

18 So, from a -- a management standpoint, and
19 achieving a faster rate of herd size recovery, I mean,
20 could ENR, you know, perhaps elaborate on any sort of
21 analysis that was used to come up with the 3 percent?

22 We're -- we're just not clear where the 3
23 percent came from. Now I know there's kind of a history
24 there of caribou management, the old -- the three (3) to
25 five (5) rule that safe harvesting should probably occur

1 in there. But that's been floating around for almost
2 decades.

3 We're wondering if -- if -- a more sort of
4 contemporary analysis or consideration was given to -- to
5 coming up with 3 percent. And then -- maybe this isn't a
6 fair question, but then why it went to four (4) and maybe
7 that's -- maybe we're getting beyond the -- the scope of
8 this hearing to go there because it involves another
9 group that isn't even in attendance.

10 And maybe I should let -- I don't know if
11 we need a legal opinion on that, but we can drop that end
12 of the question if you like, but...

13 MR. JOHN DONIHEE: Mr. Chairman, John
14 Donihee here. I believe ENR may have that information
15 because of their involvement with the Inuvialuit, and
16 there's no reason not to provide it to the Board.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, John. So,
18 going back to that -- your question then? Go ahead.

19

20 (BRIEF PAUSE)

21

22 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. The --
23 the person I usually turn to for answers like that is Ray
24 Case, and he's not here. So, I could -- I could
25 undertake to look at why we -- why we're using that

1 number, because I personally don't have an answer to that
2 question.

3 And my understanding is that the -- the
4 number as well will vary depending on whether animals are
5 increasing or decreasing.

6 Jan was saying that in the Yukon they use
7 the 3 percent for the Woodland caribou herds that they
8 have that -- have stable -- that are stable and have good
9 recruitment.

10 So, if you want to make that Undertaking
11 Number 3, then I can try and find out some more about
12 that.

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, Susan -- yeah,
14 okay. The Undertaking number 3 then, and that's to do
15 with how you come up with the 3 percent or the 4 percent.
16 And maybe, also, you know, give us some -- some -- I
17 don't know what kind of time you would need. Probably a
18 month or so.

19 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. I'd like
20 to limit it to looking at the 3 percent number. The 4
21 percent number was that the Wildlife Management Advisory
22 Council and Inuvialuit region recommended was based on
23 consultation that they did with their communities.

24 So, I don't really want to speak to that.

25 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, okay. I -- I

1 think Paul's happy with that. So, yeah, stick to 3
2 percent and Undertaking Number 3, and within -- I don't
3 know -- whatever time you need, I guess -- a month? Or
4 about the same time that you're gonna do the other
5 Undertakings.

6

7 --- UNDERTAKING NO. 3: ENR to provide a more
8 contemporary analysis or what
9 consideration was given to
10 coming up with 3 percent. To
11 complete within a month.

12

13 (BRIEF PAUSE)

14

15 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck, within a
16 month.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, thanks. Okay,
18 Paul, you know, how -- what -- how many more questions
19 we -- you think?

20 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Well, you took it right
21 out of my mouth --

22 THE CHAIRPERSON: Oh.

23 MR. PAUL LATOUR: -- Mr. Chairman. I'm
24 pretty well done. I do have a couple more questions that
25 I'm -- if time permitting or once the Board has had it's

1 go around I may come back to, but I'm -- I'm finished for
2 now. Thank you very much.

3 THE CHAIRPERSON: Mahsi, Paul. Okay,
4 we've got other board members here that some of them
5 would probably want to -- to bring up some -- their
6 questions. Maybe I'll start out with -- I've got Rosa
7 here, Paul, and then we've got Robert at the end here.

8 Ka, you gonna ask your question, you're
9 gonna get used to that microphone there. Go ahead.

10 MR. ROBERT KELLY: Good afternoon. Thank
11 you, Mr. Chairperson. My name is Robert Kelly. I'm with
12 the Sahtu Renewable Resource Board. I was just observing
13 on your presentation, and quite interested on your
14 surveys.

15 The surveys were conducted only in the
16 Sahtu Settlement area? The surveys conducted on the
17 Bluenose caribou was conducted only the Bluenose car -- I
18 mean only in the Sahtu area?

19 THE CHAIRPERSON: I think maybe it -- if
20 I can get -- get your slide up there and you -- you might
21 get a better idea. Yes, go ahead, Susan.

22 MS. SUSAN FLECK: There's -- there's a
23 number of surveys conducted. In March 2005 and 2006 we
24 did winter distribution and those were -- they were
25 surveys done in the Sahtu region but, as well, it was for

1 -- we were looking at distribution of all the caribou, so
2 it was up north and also to the -- the south and east.

3 And the July post calving surveys; the
4 ones done in July 2005 and 2006 where the counts were
5 done for the herd, those were done in the Inuvialuit
6 region when the Bluenose-West was up in there. And the -
7 - and then this past June, we went to all the calving
8 areas and, for the Bluenose-West, that calving area is in
9 the Inuvialuit area, and so the survey was done there.

10 MR. ROBERT KELLY: Thank you.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Just thanks, Susan. We
12 don't have that slide up but. We'll have to do it.

13 MR. ROBERT KELLY: Yeah, I want to look
14 at them. See if you could pull up slide 8. I was
15 curious to how the surveys were conducted, because I know
16 that in -- a look back in 1987 shows that -- it was
17 estimation of hundred thousand (100,000) caribou in the
18 area. That's why I asked specifically, was the survey
19 done only in the Sahtu or the whole NWT. That's why I
20 was asking if it was just in the Sahtu Settlement area.

21 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thanks Robert.

22 MR. ROBERT KELLY: Can you pull up slide
23 8?

24 JAN ADAMCZEWSKI: Slide 8?

25 MR. ROBERT KELLY: See that's the photo

1 census results. On the bottom it shows -- shows page
2 number 8. Population trend of the Bluenose-West herd.

3 JOHN DONIHEE: That's slide 16.

4 MR. ROBERT KELLY: There -- there you go.
5 Well, I'm just curious to the methodology of your survey
6 in 1987. I don't know if it was -- how it was done. So
7 I'm curious to that.

8 And I can see the huge decline in 1992.
9 And then there was an increase in 2000 so in the duration
10 I was wondering if there was anything done to help with
11 the increase of caribou. I don't know if anything was
12 done, but you can see the dramatic drop from almost
13 seventy-eight thousand (78,000) to twenty thousand
14 (20,000) in 2005.

15 So I'm really curious to how the surveys -
16 - surveys were conducted. Are they done only by
17 helicopter? They're done by, I don't know I'm curious to
18 find out what how they -- they done the surveys. Thank
19 you.

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, thanks, Robert.
21 Yes, go ahead, Susan.

22 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. I expect
23 Marsha and Alasdair might jump in on some of this so.
24 Okay, my understanding is that the survey -- the surveys
25 done in 1987, 1992, 2000, 2005, and 2006 all used the

1 same technique. So they were done in July, and there
2 were photos taken of the big post calving groups of males
3 and -- and females with calves.

4 Yeah, the -- the surveys are done using
5 fixed-wing not -- not helicopters. And what they do is
6 they have animals with radio collars on them, and they
7 fly around listening for them. And then when they find
8 some they look for all the caribou in the area, and take
9 the photos of them. And they do that over, oh, usually a
10 one (1) or two (2) days; one (1) or two (2) day period.

11 So it's -- it's a lot of flying in a
12 couple of days and before -- before they do the survey
13 they'll have flown around to have some idea of where all
14 the animals are. And they don't do the survey if the
15 animals are still kind of scattered. They wait until a
16 day when the -- it's hot and buggy and the animals group
17 up into big groups. And that's what they used for all
18 those different years.

19 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

20 MR. ROBERT KELLY: Yep, thank you very
21 much that's the response. There's also a number of other
22 questions and -- questions that are brought up. Mine is
23 very relevant to some of the members that have brought
24 some of the questions up, because I don't believe that
25 it's only harvesters that are taking the caribou.

1 There's natural other reasons why there's
2 a decrease in caribou. Something I just wanted to bring
3 up, and just for sake of thought because one of the
4 things you see happening and is being questioned is the
5 global warming. You can see that effect on the animals.
6 Recently a couple of months ago you seen in the newspaper
7 there was polar bears on the -- the Aklavik.

8 So I'm wondering if you have any thought
9 to if that's having an effect on the caribou. Thank you.

10 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Robert.

11

12 (BRIEF PAUSE)

13

14 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. We -- we
15 agree that -- that there are natural reasons why the --
16 the caribou are going up and down. We don't know what
17 effect climate change will have, and it's something that
18 we're also worried about.

19 So far in the north a lot of the changes
20 due to climate change have been reported by people who
21 are out on the land. And then the scientists go oh,
22 you're seeing those changes, and then they're going out
23 and setting up studies to -- to look at how -- look at
24 those changes. The -- it's not -- it's -- it isn't --
25 the -- when we have -- the little bit of modelling that's

1 -- the modelling that's been done on the Bathurst herd it
2 -- it shows that it's not just harvesting that affects
3 the caribou. It's -- it's the number of calves that are
4 being born, and how many of them are surviving and that
5 is a big factor and the other big factor is the survival
6 of the fe -- of the adult females.

7 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: Yeah, it's Alasdair
8 Veitch, ENR. Just to add to Susan's point.

9 We have got seven (7) -- seven (7) years
10 of either quantifying calf cow ratios on the calving
11 grounds or estimating it from the photographs that we've
12 taken. For six (6) years before -- from 2000 to 2006 we
13 found that calf productivity for the Bluenose-West herd
14 was considered low for barren-ground caribou. The
15 numbers that we had are not the kind of numbers that you
16 would expect to see in a herd that was stable or
17 increasing. They're the kind of numbers you'd expect to
18 see in a herd that was in -- in decline.

19 One of the things that was noted during
20 those years was a rather steady change in the date of
21 calving. Calving switched from being something that we
22 would see peaked around about the 10th to the 15th of
23 June to the point where in later about 2004, 2005 as late
24 as June 23rd over half the cows still hadn't produced a
25 calf. One of the things that we do know is that with

1 barren-ground caribou calves that are produced late in
2 the year have a much lower chance of survival.

3 So one of the -- one of the problems that
4 we have with the Bluenose herd right now is that we don't
5 -- we don't have the kind of recruitment numbers that we
6 need in order to -- in order to see a significant
7 increase in the herd. And, we -- we don't know what's
8 causing that late calving, but we -- we certainly did
9 document that it was -- it was occurring.

10 The good news is that this past year we
11 had a very good calf-cow ratio. This past summer the
12 calf-cow ratio was, I believe, eighty-one (81) calves per
13 hundred (100) cows which is what the kind of numbers that
14 we -- we're looking for. What's going to be important
15 now for us is to go out in April and get an idea of how
16 many of those calves produced last year -- this past
17 summer make it through the winter. Because if we can get
18 a couple of -- couple or three (3) good years of good
19 recruitment, then that will go a long way to changing
20 that curve from going down to one that's going up.

21 So, yeah, we just want to empathize to --
22 especially to the -- to the people who are harvesters
23 here ENR in -- in no way has ever suggested that they --
24 the main thing driving this cycle are these numbers that
25 we're seeing is harvest. It's just one (1) component.

5 Going back, go back to that slide that you
6 had there with the trends there, population trends.
7 While he's doing that the confidence limits for 1992 and
8 2000 compare to say 1987 and the 2005, 2006, you know,
9 it's quite varied there, isn't it? Is that -- is there a
10 reason for that, Alasdair?

11

12 (BRIEF PAUSE)

13

14 THE CHAIRPERSON: Any -- anybody there,
15 it doesn't matter.

MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Marsha Branigan
here from ENR in Inuvik. Basically in 1992 and in 2000 we did not photograph all, as many of the caribou that were available to be photographed. So they didn't group up as tightly, and we didn't get all the animals found. So for example in 1992 we only photographed twenty-three (23) of the thirty-one (31) that were available.

24 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

25 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: And in 2000 we only

1 photographed thirty-two (32) out of fifty (50). So when
2 you don't photograph them all, you have a wider error --
3 error in your estimates. Yeah those -- and those
4 confidence intervals are still pretty good even in those
5 years, but you -- they were better in some years than
6 others, and that's the reason why.

7 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, but I was just
8 wondering if -- if you'd took the upper confidence limit
9 in 1992 and the lower in 2000, you know, your curve is --
10 is still going down, and I think -- I think that's what
11 Robert was looking at what caused that bump there, but I
12 think that clarifies for us, thanks.

13 MR. ROBERT KELLY: One more question?

14 THE CHAIRPERSON: Sure, okay, yeah,
15 Robert go ahead. You can do that.

16 MR. ROBERT KELLY: Yeah, one of my
17 questions was in -- in that -- in that time frame 1992 to
18 2000 did -- was anything done to help the increase in
19 caribou herd?

20 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, Robert, I think
21 they've got that question, yeah.

22 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. When for
23 -- for 1992 to 2000 as -- as you pointed out, Walter, the
24 -- there are -- there's bigger confidence limits. And so
25 from a statistical point it -- we couldn't say that for

1 that the numbers are that different so we would have to
2 say that it -- it might be the survey technique and it
3 could -- it's possible that the numbers could have been
4 similar. So when we look at that kind of information, we
5 like to have at least three (3) surveys to compare
6 because then you can get a better understanding of what
7 the trend is.

8 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, thanks.

9 MS. SUSAN FLECK: And there's one other
10 point, after in the -- the around '95.

11 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: In '95.

12 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: In '96.

MS. SUSAN FLECK: Around 1996 the discussion started to develop a management plan for the herd to look at that. So, but there were no other management actions taken.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Ka, Robert, mahsi cho,
18 thanks. Okay, thank you, Robert. And we have other
19 members here that -- that are free to -- to question
20 ENR's presentation as well. They will go back to -- to
21 the right and hear Keith, maybe we'll start with you if.

22 MR. KEITH HICKLING: Thank you, Mr.
23 Chair. Keith Hickling, board member.

24 We've heard discussions mostly from the
25 community members with regards to noise. And it's -- in

1 the last five (5) years our region has seen an increased
2 in mining exploration. So I'm asking ENR the initiatives
3 or any of the works been done with regards to public
4 education with that industry and namely their aviation
5 partners. Thank you.

6 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Keith.

7

8 (BRIEF PAUSE)

9

10 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, Susan.

11 MS. SUSAN FLECK: It's Susan Fleck. One
12 thing that the department did over the past year is put
13 together a -- a small brochure on -- for the aviation
14 industry, and for the mining, and oil and gas people to
15 tell them there's certain times when they shouldn't be
16 flying low. And so we've been handing that out to try
17 and help educate them especially for calving areas and
18 migration times for barren-ground caribou. Excuse me, as
19 well as in the mountains for -- for sheep, when they're
20 having their calves.

21 Marsha says that up in the Inuvialuit
22 region, -- the Inuvialuit Game Council developed some
23 guidelines for minimum heights for flying. And -- and
24 most companies up there are aware of them and -- and have
25 adopted those guidelines.

1 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan. That's
2 good there, Keith? Yeah, what you got some more
3 questions, sir.

4 MR. KEITH HICKLING: I think there were
5 one (1) or two (2).

6 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yes, okay thank you,
7 Keith. Then just, you know, my curiosity just going from
8 my recollection with the -- with the wildlife act maybe
9 they can help me. Does -- the Wildlife Act used to have
10 a minimum height level for -- is that still there you
11 know? Go ahead, Susan.

12 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. None of
13 us are aware of anything in the Wildlife Act, but there
14 is a -- a section on harassment and -- and people can be
15 charged for harassing animals as long, but if -- not if
16 they're hunting them.

17 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, thanks. The --
18 okay we got one more member here, Camilla Rabasca. I'll
19 have to ask her and she can, okay. If you, you know, you
20 have a chance to ask questions. If not then it's up to
21 you, if you can -- you can do them later or some other
22 time just for the record.

23 MS. CAMILLA RABISCA: No, all the
24 questions I wanted to ask are asked already, so, I don't
25 have -- I don't have any questions.

1 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Camilla. Then
2 going back to myself here I have, you know, one of the
3 things that, you know, and just like any information we
4 deal with is if you go to slide just to name all of --
5 all of the -- all of the herds, I guess it's on page 2,
6 it'll be Slide 3, I guess.

7 In there -- there's a -- the slide that
8 says How Are Herds Defined, gives you a really good
9 picture of all the herds. And, you know, just going back
10 to listening to -- to Jim Pierrot about some of the --
11 the names that they have for herds, and certainly,
12 myself, I'm -- I'm well aware of what people call these
13 herds.

14 If you go right to the -- I don't if any,
15 but most people can see -- can see the herds. But the --
16 the Bluenose, generally, in this area here. Once you get
17 into -- into these -- this area pa -- peninsula, that
18 herd is called the Cape Bathurst herd, okay. This one?
19 Okay.

20 And then this herd is called the Bathurst
21 Herd, right? Okay, this herd then, here. Here's the
22 Bathurst Inlet then here then. Now a lot, you know, with
23 all the -- the information that we gave out a lot --
24 many, many times there's confusion over the Cape Bathurst
25 and the Bathurst Herd. And I think we mentioned that a

1 few times.

2 At some point we, you know, we -- we may
3 want to think about changing those names. At least, you
4 know, like -- like I mentioned, Jim Pierrot mentioned the
5 names for -- for these herds. I think we -- we may have
6 to -- to look at that. I hope it doesn't confuse the
7 people that do the work. But certainly the for -- for
8 the public, I'd rather use other terms than Cape Bathurst
9 and Bathurst because it saves so much confusion.

10 Imagine what -- what the translators are
11 saying, you know. How do you pronounce Cape Bathurst and
12 Bathurst, that's impossible.

13 Anyway, I don't think we have any more --
14 I don't have any more questions. I think I -- I covered
15 a lot of the, you know, the questions I have is -- is
16 pretty well, is -- is gonna -- is going to be answered.

17 Yeah, well, I'll -- well, I'll go around
18 one (1) more time to make sure that questions don't, you
19 know, when people ask questions, other questions would
20 come up so, Paul has quite a few and...

21 MR. PAUL LATOUR: No.

22 THE CHAIRPERSON: What -- you -- well, I
23 know you had quite a few, and then now going back to some
24 of the -- the ones that you, you know, want to finish off
25 with so. We can do that, I guess if you want. Okay. Go

1 ahead, Paul.

2 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Paul Latour, Board
3 Member. In the presentation this morning and then, I
4 think, in the IR response 1.1, there was reference to
5 management planning. I got a question here to ENR and in
6 what -- who, in their opinion, has the primary
7 responsibility for management planning associated with
8 this herd, or does anybody?

9 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Paul. Yeah, go
10 ahead, Susan.

11 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Susan Fleck. In -- in
12 our opinion, the co-management boards have the
13 responsibility and -- and our role is to provide advice
14 and support for that to occur. There is a -- a Bluenose
15 Management Cooperation Agreement that was signed, I
16 think, in 19 --

17 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: 2000.

18 MS. SUSAN FLECK: -- in 2000.

19 MR. ALASDAIR VEITCH: 2000.

20 MS. SUSAN FLECK: And it's signed off by
21 the Chairs of the Wildlife Management Advisory Council,
22 the Gwich'in Renewable Resource Board, the Sahtu
23 Renewable Resource Board, and the Tuktut Nogait National
24 Park Management Committee.

25 MS. MARSHA BRANIGAN: Board.

1 MS. SUSAN FLECK: Or Board, whatever.
2 And the -- it -- our view is that it also now needs to be
3 expanded to include the -- the Wek'eezhii Renewable
4 Resource Board. And under that agree -- the purpose of
5 that agreement is to work on management planning
6 cooperatively.

7 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan. And
8 that's the -- the Bluenose Caribou Advisory Committee.
9 Okay. Okay, that answers your question, Paul?

10 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Well, not really. So,
11 in -- if -- if this Board has the primary responsibility,
12 what does that mean? Does that -- is that the full gamut
13 of the financial responsibility, time responsibility, all
14 responsibilities or...?

15 And then I just heard "cooperative" again.
16 So I'm -- I'm still a little confused as to how the
17 various roles are perceived in -- in management planning,
18 which I think we all recognize has to happen again.

19 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, okay, Paul.
20 Yeah, Susan...?

21 MS. SUSAN FLECK: It's Susan Fleck. In -
22 - in our presentation, we -- we said that we -- we do
23 have some funding. We had requested funding through the
24 -- the Caribou Management Strategy to update the Bluenose
25 Management Plan, and we'd be prepared to initiate that

1 process to occur. And we're just looking for guidance
2 from the Board on that matter.

3

4 (BRIEF PAUSE)

5

6 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay.

7 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Just, yeah, sorry --
8 sorry, Paul Latour here again. One (1) -- one (1) last
9 question. Just the -- the Board's wondering what ENR's
10 expectations are from the SRRB in this process.

11 What -- what are you expecting out of us
12 in this process?

13 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, Paul. Yeah, go
14 ahead, Susan.

15 MS. SUSAN FLECK: It's Susan Fleck. So I
16 -- I just want to clarify. Is it the management planning
17 process that you're talking about, or this public hearing
18 process?

19 MR. PAUL LATOUR: I guess in part what do
20 you expect coming out of this particular hearing in terms
21 of a, I guess, a product. Yeah, let's -- let's leave it
22 at that for now.

23 THE CHAIRPERSON: Okay, Paul. Go ahead,
24 Susan.

25 MS. SUSAN FLECK: It's Susan Fleck. I

1 guess we're expecting the same thing that we usually
2 expect from any Board, any of the Renewable Resource
3 Board meetings, or the Advisory Council, the Wildlife
4 Management Advisory Council, is our recommendations for
5 management actions, and then we take those management
6 actions and work with the Boards to run the communities
7 to implement them.

8 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Susan.

9 MR. PAUL LATOUR: Okay, thank you.

10 That's all, Mr. Chair.

11 THE CHAIRPERSON: Thanks, Paul. The --
12 we're -- do you know where -- what -- 4:30 now. I don't
13 know, I'm going to leave it up to -- to the -- that's the
14 Behdzi Ahda' First Nations presentation people if they
15 want to start their presentations today. I know it's
16 pretty late in the day, so. You know, I'd rather think
17 that they -- they would want to do it in the morning.

18 I mean, I -- do it in the morning? Yeah,
19 it -- it's pretty late, and I think we get an early break
20 today and then we can -- if we start tomorrow at 9:00.
21 We -- we have to start at 9:00, because today we started
22 at 10:00 and keep pushing things. And I think I'd, you
23 know, we get here tomorrow at 9:00 and first -- first
24 thing we do tomorrow is have the Behdzi Ahda' -- their
25 presentations and then, you know, we'll -- we'll -- I

1 think we should be -- we should be within our -- our
2 scheduled time.

3 But tomorrow I think I want to spend a lot
4 of time there, you know, make sure that everybody is
5 happy with their presentations and enough time for all
6 them to do whatever presentations and information they
7 want to give the Board.

8 So, unless we don't have anymore questions
9 from our Board here or something that I -- I missed, I
10 think, you know, it's -- it's a long day for our Board.
11 We -- we've been here since nine o'clock, so, you know.

12 I'd like to thank everybody that was --
13 that came here. I really -- I really enjoyed all the
14 people that are here and the interest that people have
15 shown. I hope we -- it's even better tomorrow. I liked
16 the food today.

17 So let's try to get here, I want to get
18 rolling tomorrow by nine o'clock, like I mentioned. So
19 once we do -- if we can do that tomorrow, we'll start out
20 with Behdzi Ahda' presentation. You know, I'm -- I'm
21 gonna allow some -- some -- if people have, you know,
22 some remarks or small comments to make.

23 You have one Lawrence? Yeah, go ahead.

24 MR. LAWRENCE MANUEL: Hi, I'm Lawrence
25 Manuel. I'm with the Renewable Resource Board. I got a

1 question for you guys. Remember this past summer when
2 they talk about the collars on the caribou; that the
3 Elders and our self were against -- like with -- like
4 when the -- they talk about the collars on the caribou.
5 Someplace in the Inuvialuit, I'm still kind of concerned
6 about it, like, does this thing got anything to do with
7 when the lightening hit the -- the ground where the
8 caribous are? Does that affect the -- the lightening?

9 Because in that area they found about --
10 something like twelve (12) to fifteen (15) dead caribou
11 there. I think you guys are aware of that.

12 THE CHAIRPERSON: I -- I think this is
13 more for information, but, yeah, go ahead, if -- if you
14 want to answer that.

15 MS. SUSAN FLECK: It's Susan Fleck. As
16 far as we know, there were no collars on those -- on
17 those caribou, and their -- every few years we get
18 reports of caribou that have died from lightening. So we
19 -- I know there was one (1) about four (4) year -- five
20 (5) years on the Bathurst Range as well.

21 THE CHAIRPERSON: Yeah, thanks, Susan.
22 So I think if -- if we don't -- you know, unless we have
23 comments or something that people want to do tomorrow,
24 like I said, check with me tomorrow. Tomorrow we'll
25 start with Behdzi Ahda' First Nation's presentation, you

1 know.

2 Let me know about if you want to speak and
3 all, I'll show you how these -- how our schedules work
4 and, certainly, the information that you want, we can
5 certainly help you with that too.

6 So with that I -- I'd like to -- to thank
7 everybody for coming today and, you know, it was very --
8 this was probably my first -- the first time I've -- I've
9 shared a hearing. So it's a-- it's quite a challenge for
10 me. The -- the Boards, you know, at the end of the day I
11 -- I'd, you know, if anybody has comments, you know, just
12 something that you want to thank somebody or whatever.
13 If -- if not then I'm gonna be closing the hearing for
14 the day. Mahsi, thank you.

15

16 --- Upon adjourning at 4:34 p.m.

17

18

19 Certified Correct,

20

21

22

23 Sean Coleman

24

25